

Content Analysis of the Provincial Pakistan Studies Textbook for Class IX-X

Kiran Hashmi *

Abstract: *The paper presents the results of the content analysis of the Pakistan Studies textbooks, of grade IX and X, published by the Sind Textbook Board (STBB). The content was evaluated against the objectives, set by the Federal Ministry of Education. The analysis includes the connections between the selected content and the set framework with additional focus on the quality of the textbook with respect to its printing and publishing styles. An adapted content analysis checklist by (Marsh & White, 2006) was used for the study. Results show quite a few similarities between the national objectives and the selected content, however, some differences were detected while comparing the matter with the framework. The content analysis, of the selected textbook, also shows that they retain the content directed by the national curriculum, however, the ways (examples, content of the images etc.) in which authors present the topic differ. The findings of the study highlight a number of flaws in the content of the textbook. Pakistan Studies, being one of the most important subjects for the citizens of Pakistan, is being dealt in the worst way. The problem lies in the selection of matter, use of outdated statistics and factual data, in congruence with the national objectives and substandard matter and printing materials. Based on the analysis, recommendations are made including rewriting of the textbook in lieu with theory and practice, piloting of the textbook, assessment of selected matter and objective, and review by experts after two years. It is expected that the study would provide guidance to the curriculum developers and textbook authors about the criteria for the content selected and published and would also benefit content with respect to the national objectives.*

Keywords: Cooperation, Interaction, Academic Achievement, Social Skills.

1 Introduction

According to the *National Curriculum of Pakistan Studies Grade IX and X (2006)*, Pakistan was established on the basis of Islamic ideology in 1947. Its ideology is also well reflected in the constitution of Pakistan. The objective of the Ideology of Pakistan is to provide a model for an exemplary state for the world in terms of the promotion and the propagation of the Islamic principles.

After the Fall of Dhaka in 1971, there was an urgent need to boost the national unity and patriotism among the residue (West) Pakistanis. It was thought that it could only be possible if changes were brought about in the national curriculum of Pakistan. Therefore, for the first time in the Education Policy in

*PhD Scholar, IQRA University, Karachi 75300, Pakistan. E-mail: kiranhashmi@yahoo.com & kiran.hashmi@ndie.edu.pk

1972, the subject “Pakistan Studies” was introduced at different educational levels. Subsequently, it became compulsory in 1985 (Shahid, 2007)

According to the constitution of 1973, Pakistan was engraved out of India in 1947. The main purpose of its creation, as a sovereign state, was to protect the political rights of the Muslims in South Asia. Since, the creators of Pakistan were Western educated leaders, they envisaged that the new state would sustain the values of individual autonomy, civic equality and religious multiplicity. They did not desire an Islamic society (Jalal, 1994). Pakistan is governed under the Islamic and democratic federal Constitution of 1973, comprises of four self-governing provinces: Punjab, Sindh, Khyber Pakhtoonkhwa and Balochistan. Education in Pakistan is essentially a provincial affair. For five decades, a union of internal and external forces and events has struck upon the social, political and cultural philosophy of Pakistan, which moved the religious and non-democratic forces to political powers. These groups had given their own versions of Pakistani citizen and its characteristics. These groups promoted their visions of what a good citizen of Pakistan needs to be acquainted with, what knowledge is of most value, what kind of society is advantageous, and what curriculum policies need to be implemented in schools nationwide. Therefore, one of the mediums through which the goals of Pakistan’s national policy on curriculum can be analyzed is by reviewing text books of Pakistan Studies to evaluate how the national policies are followed in curriculum.

Textbooks are a standard work, on a particular subject, designed for classrooms, with appropriate vocabulary, illustrations, student exercises and teacher aids. Texts may be written for any age and of any sector of education, however, at all levels they aim to provide an orderly introduction to a discipline or subject area which can enable students towards independent learning (Ibad, 2012). In all modern school systems, the textbooks have long served not only to support instructions but also symbolize those instructions, or in other words, the textbooks define the curriculum. The basic road map, for the public and private schools in Pakistan, is provided by the curriculum wing of the federal ministry of education. For this study, the content of the Pakistan Studies’ textbooks, for grades IX and X, is evaluated against the national objectives drafted by the Federal Ministry of Education.

2 Literature Review

According to Khan (2010) the main purpose of teaching Pakistan Studies is to promote the knowledge of an individual being a citizen of Pakistan, the country and the world around him and also on importance of nation building, and development of social and moral consciousness that should lead to healthy living in a democratic society. The curriculum is mainly designed to accomplish these goals with the help of some integral variables such as national integration, cohesion and patriotism (Saqib, 2004). The National Curriculum for Pakistan Studies is a framework used by all maintained schools to ensure that teaching and learning is balanced and consistent. These help to translate the National

Curriculum's objectives into teaching and learning activities. In the Pakistan Studies curriculum, priority is given to investigate the extent to which it represents ethnic nationalities of Pakistan, and the extent to which it demonstrates its part to the process of national cohesion and integration. The subject's timeline is divided into four major areas, of political changes that have dominated the history of modern Pakistan, including the early establishment era from 1947 to 1955 when the one-unit scheme was imposed by the federal government, the one-unit era from 1955 to 1968 until the military coup of President General Yahya Khan, the post one-unit era from 1970 to the Islamization era, during which East Pakistan separated to become Bangladesh, the first civilian government was established and overthrown, and processes of Islamization were introduced and lastly, the age after Islamization till date where a number of changes have occurred changing the political situation of the country (Hashmi, 2011; Khawaja, 2011; Hussain, 1983).

Consequently, the goals of Pakistan's national policy on curriculum to be analyzed with its reviews through the Pakistani school textbooks on history and social studies to evaluate how the national curriculum guidelines are being followed (Naseem, 2005). (Sadiq, 2005) stated that in the beginning of Pakistan Studies, there was the occurrence of an integrative ideology, that might be nationalist, however, could also be religious, racist, developmentalist, or fashioned along other lines, as long as it provides for integrating the subgroups of the population of Pakistan into one society. Later, in the 1970's decade it was observed that, it was considered that an integrated society was required where, all its several elements could communicate more often with each other than with outsiders. Thus, affecting the curriculum of Pakistan Studies again.

The 1976 Act of Parliament, sanctioned the Ministry of Education appoint capable authorities to perform curriculum-related functions. Those were including prepare or commission: schemes for studies; curricula, textbook manuscripts and strategic schedules for their introduction in various classes of educational institutions; approve manuscripts of textbooks produced by other agencies. Before their contents must be evaluated by they are prescribed in various classes of an educational institution; direct any person or agency in writing (within a specified period) to delete, amend or withdraw any portion, or the whole, of a curriculum, textbook or reference material prescribed for any class of an educational institution.

Accordingly, a Central/National Bureau of Curriculum and Textbooks (NBCT), commonly known as the Curriculum Wing was appointed to supervise curriculum and textbooks development or approval and to maintain curriculum standards from the primary to the higher secondary levels. An Examination of the Social Studies Curriculum in Pakistan since the 1980s, the mission of the national citizenship education curriculum in Pakistan has been the Islamization of society. The government curriculum guidelines require textbooks to emphasize Islam as the national ideology of the state of Pakistan.

To achieve their political goals, they have revised history, advanced a manufactured heritage of the state of Pakistan, and promoted an Islamic standard of citizenship education in the nation's schools through the social studies curricu-

lum. Many textbooks of Pakistan Studies, published by the public and private sector, claim that Pakistan was made to protect the rights of Muslims and is the land of Islam. Therefore, all efforts should be directed to make it an 'Islamic welfare state'.

3 Methodology

For this study, qualitative research paradigm was selected for the content analysis of the Pakistan Studies Textbook. The instrument was divided into four parts. Part A was of the relationship between content and material of the textbook. The areas of the content of the textbook explored were the developmental history, approach, objectives, issues orientation, and multiculturalism and sex roles, scope for the unit and sequence and linkage of the content given in the Pakistan Studies textbook of grade IX. Part B was related to the instructions and the properties of the materials given in the textbook. This segment was further categorized into various aspects such as clarity of the content, readability of the content, coordination between various chapters, individualization of the units, instructional pattern of the units, learner characteristics, instructional time to each unit, management system, motivational properties, assessment criteria of the units, instructional strategies, media used, prerequisite for the units in the content, role of the teacher and the role of the student. Part C included the publishing details of the textbook. It was further categorized into the items containing the details of the authors, cost of the textbook, special requirements for teaching the textbook, teacher training, textbook components, aesthetic appeal of the textbook, durability and above all the overall quality of the textbook.

3.1 Findings of the Content Analysis of Pakistan Studies Textbook

3.1.1 Pakistan Studies Curriculum

The Pakistan Studies curricula has been borrowed directly from the idea of Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, according to which he wanted all Pakistanis to be Pakistanis irrespective of their regional, ethnic, cultural and religious differences (Kazimi, 2009). Pakistan Studies has mainly been introduced to produce patriotic Pakistanis without any discrimination on provincial and religious grounds. Therefore, the curriculum designed by curriculum developers reflect the same vision. Many textbooks of Pakistan Studies, published by the public and private sector, do claim that Pakistan has been made to protect the rights of Muslims and is the land of Islam and all efforts should be directed at making it an 'Islamic welfare state'. (Jalal, 2009)

The National Curriculum for Pakistan Studies is a framework used by all maintained schools to ensure that teaching and learning is balanced and consistent. Many schools use the Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (QCA) Schemes of Work to plan their curriculum. These help to translate the National

Curriculum's objectives into teaching and learning activities. The aims, derived from national goals, towards which a national policy is directed and efforts of the nation are applied (Durrani, 2009). The findings of the content analysis is mentioned below.

3.1.2 Quality of the Content

Pakistan studies is considered to be a boring subject, as per the content selected for it, generally appears as meaningless to teach in the class. Multiple issues and errors are present in the statistical data and information given in the textbook. There are no illustrations and figures to bring interest for learners, the way other private publishers have. There is poor quality of the content presented in the textbooks. There are extended syllabi with very less information on them. For example, the topic of Sir Syed Ahmed Khan has been covered just in a single paragraph, whereas the ideology of Pakistan, i.e. Islamic ideology, is explained in a complete chapter, which is more of an Islamiyat topic rather Pakistan Studies. The quality of language, used in the textbook, is not according to the mental level of the students. The sentences are merely translated from the Urdu version of the textbook. There is no Teachers' Guide available to assist the teachers in pedagogy. There is no information given or described anywhere in the content on teaching methodology, assessment criteria. Overall the quality of the content of the textbook is below average and also fails to gauge the attention of the teachers as well as the students, or, any reader in specific.

3.1.3 Alignment of the Content with Curriculum Objectives

Besides few areas, such as the national heroes and freedom movement, most of the content is not aligned with the objectives. There is a vast gap in the broad objectives set and the content selected to achieve those targets. The matter of the textbook is limited to knowledge level only. Activities in the chapters are also quite negligible. The students are unable to figure out the purpose of their studies through shared content.

3.1.4 Rationale of Writing the Textbook

The textbook was written with the consensus of representatives from all the provinces, as Pakistan Studies is a national subject. These chapters of the textbook were written after the education policy of 1999 in 2002 and revised in 2006 and later in 2009 for grade IX (Ministry of Education, 2006). Varied and multiple perceptions of the representatives of the provinces can be seen in the curriculum as all the members share their respective views. This change, in the perception, varies from Islam to Pakistan to different provinces, national integrity etc. The differences lie in the Pakistani ideology and its creation. The first two chapters (page 5 and 11), in the text book, are based on these two aspects and the remaining chapters are factual in nature like Land and

Climate of Pakistan, Natural Resources, Population etc. Apprehension lies on the chapter of Culture. Sindh Textbook Board (STBB) selected three writers to write this text book. There is lack of coordination among the authors and it has badly affected the quality of the content. For this textbook, the writers were not informed about the rationale of the chapters. The supervisors, in the panel of supervision of the textbook, were only allowed to amend few facts and figures. As per the policy, supervision actually means minimum changes to be made in any document. Changes in the matter of the content can only be made in the workshops, where the speaker speaks and the members suggest amendments. For this textbook, no intimation was sent for the conductance of workshops.

The prime objective of this textbook is to develop the feeling of Pakistanism; the in-depth love for the country in the first place and secondly Islamism (love for religion) among the students. On the basis of these two prime objectives, the rationale of the textbook seem quite well as the content of the textbook talks about both Pakistanism and Islamism. (Chaudry, 2010)

3.1.5 Objectivity of the Content

In Pakistan, there are two major lobbies; the Leftist Writers who are liberals or democratic, and the Rightist Writers who are mainly the orthodox and traditional ones. The book reflects the ideas and vision of rightist wing while there is no reflection of the left wing found in the book. This means that influence of the Rightist Wing of Pakistan is more dominant here. Other than this, the textbook loses its objectivity when it comes down to the teaching of believes such as doctrine of faith, justice, equality, tolerance etc which are added however, mis-matched with the content. Besides this, the two nation theory and the ideology of Pakistan has been explained in a complicated way, which resulted in the loss of its objectivity. There is more emphasis given to history of Pakistan than Geography, however, link to integrate both history and geography to achieve maximum results from the new generation is missing. Topics are more inclined to theoretical contents and less to practical situations.

3.1.6 Issues in the Content

The Pakistan Studies textbook for grade IX lacks the essence of professional and experienced writers. The personal information of the authors and co- authors are also not given. The authors are not supposed to be in the panel of supervision, as it increases the element of biasness, which makes it unavoidable. Complete details of the authors are also not provided in the textbook as it is done in the private publishing agencies.

There are multiple flaws which can be identified. One more flaw identified in the textbook is its gender biasness. Only males have been given representation, who worked in the struggle for Pakistan and no representation of women has been shown. Other than this, cultural and religious biasness is also visible as only the religion of Islam is mentioned here and no other religion is given any importance. This is a major issue, as the other minorities, studying this

subject, feel isolated and develop a feeling of ignorance and negligence. Another major issue, identified here, is the frequent use of outdated factual data and statistics and needs immediate revision. Secondly, there are only four maps in the textbook, which are not even colored and no pictures available resulting in a low face value of the textbook and the reader's attention are easily diverted.

The other important flaw is that the matter of the content is extremely short for both the teacher and the student. Teachers can never get the desired outcome with such reduced information given in the textbook. Too many topics are added with little information on them. Teachers can only provide superficial information to the students, and the students can only get surface level understanding of the subject. With such reduced information, the broad objectives set seem inevitable to be achieved.

The other flaw of the content, is the lack of development of visualization or imaginative thinking, especially in the part of history. This issue resulted from the ineffectiveness of the authors of the textbook who are not professional writers. Creativity, in the writing, is missing and the content of the textbook seems more like printed notes of a coaching center than of a well thought and well written content.

The assessment criteria is quite vague. Although, Pakistan Studies is one of the compulsory subjects, its total weightage is only 75 marks, whereas, the rest of the compulsory subjects are of 100 marks. Mainly subjective or essay based answers are asked in the assessment. The assessment system also lacks objectivity.

Only one of the writers of the textbook was from the social studies background, otherwise no other author of the Pakistan Studies textbook is familiar or known. Another issue is the supervision committee, comprised of many members. Few of the members, of the supervision committee, have only consolidated the matter; otherwise they have not done anything. Not even a single map is colored. The heading of content is written with very bold words so that the child can see it. No pilot testing of the textbook has ever been done to find the issues in it.

3.1.7 Textbook Presentation

The major problem of STBB is having a limited number of pages in the textbook. In limiting the pages, the writer is bound to complete the content within the set limit; therefore, a lot of important aspects are left out. As a result, the textbook loses its charm and appeal. The textbook of grade 9 has 174 pages. This shows that 174 pages were given as fixed number to the authors. These are the pages with a limited size of the paper, which reduces the chances of adding clip art and examples in the content. Due to this policy, the assessment always remains handicapped. Assessment and activities cannot be added due to the fixation of the chapters. The whole book is written in font size 14. All STBB books have font 14 from class 1 till onwards. Curriculum does not provide any guideline for the appropriate font size and format of children of different ages.

3.1.8 Effectiveness of the Textbook

The textbook is full of information. The textbook is extraordinarily elaborated for class 9-10 students. This textbook contains extra information which the child does not require to know at this level. The textbook lacks continuity. Continuity can be seen from chapter 1 till 3. Chapters 8, 9 and 10 should have been brought up in the list. Then, chapters 4, 5, 6 should have been put to maintain continuity of the lessons. Chapter 1 “Ideological basis of Pakistan”, ideology of Pakistan is superficially stated. Similarly, the information given on the Pakistan movement is also quite superficial. This means that the underlying causes of political, social, economical and religious issues, which the Muslims had in the rule of British assisted by the Hindus, have been completely eliminated, crushing the Muslims feelings and aspirations of taking Pakistan from them. In geography, the geographical location of Pakistan is not given anywhere. On the other hand, the chapter of industrial development of Pakistan has been simply lifted from the economics book and has been made a chapter in the Pakistan Studies textbook.

The textbook presents a strong reflection of political and personal influence in the matter. The committees who take decisions, their approaches also change with respect to situation and political influence. A student can only understand the underline meaning of the criticisms on the ideology made by Rehmat Ali after reaching masters’ level and conducting research on him.

The approach of Quaid-e-Azam for Pakistan was purely an approach of Pakistanism, an approach of nationalism. The philosophy of two nation theory blended with the approach of Pakistanism in order to develop the spirit of democracy, fundamentals of law and civil rights and concept of welfare state. These approaches although identified in the curriculum, are not reflected in the textbook. The interferences of the Islamic sector were not very much there in the beginning. It became influential in the later years mainly with the support of military dictators, an example can be taken from General Zia. After that, the Jihadi movements’ etc. also created an impact on the society. This subject was made compulsory in 1985, reflecting his philosophy throughout the content. It can be stated that the topic related to Pakistan movements were completely edited to incorporate Zia’s philosophy, which showed that Pakistan was created solely on religious grounds while denying the fact that Jinnah had mentioned that Pakistan was a secular state, where all religions would have equal importance.

The textbook has glimpses on the reflections of the conflicting schools of thought. There are three schools of thought in Pakistan which are fighting with each other on various points. The first one says that Pakistan should lead towards religious fanaticism, which was originated from the time of Aurangzeb Alamgir. The second is influenced with Dara Shikoh, which focuses on cultural aspects, languages, provincialism etc. They believe in the philosophy of Cultural Muslims. Religious heritage and religious culture are two different things. The third school of thought is of Sir Syed Ahmed Khan which talks about modernism and it paved the way to the creation of Pakistan.

3.1.9 Quality of the Textbook

When the content is prepared with respect to the set objectives then student's mental capability, age group and class is always kept into consideration. Looking at the content with respect to the criteria mentioned above, the quality of the content of Pakistan Studies textbook seems very low.

As the objectives are unknown to the teachers, hence, in the state of ignorance, teachers or mentors are unable to identify the vacuum of knowledge. The quality of the content seems fine to the teachers? as it contains all the information about Pakistan. On the contrary, this book is just giving the picture of history and resources. Chapter of 'Pakistan as a Welfare State' has been lifted completely from the constitution of Pakistan. From the student's point of view, the content is not student friendly.

Making teacher's guide for the textbooks is the purview of the textbook board because they are making the instructional material. Previously in 1970's, every textbook had a teacher's guide. One of the biggest issues that came across was the effectiveness of the utility of the teachers' guide. It was a support to the teachers, as it contained the topic, its possible objectives, instructional objectives, and materials to be used etc. with further activities for the teachers and for the students. It must also include extra questions which the textbook did not have but the guide had. But these guides were available only till class 5. Most of the major subjects remained unattended. There is no teacher's guide available for this textbook.

The curriculum developers of Pakistan Studies are quite patriotic in nature who has drafted 10 unachievable objectives. The objectives in the feeling of patriotism should not be given which are not measurable or achievable. In the recent curriculum of Pakistan Studies the cognitive, affective and psycho motor domains are missing. This curriculum is stuck to the Blooms level of knowledge only. There is also no room kept for these levels' incorporations. This might be the case due to the absence of pedagogicians in the curriculum committee.

The public sector has everything available. Funds are there, resources are available, material aids are available, the default lies in the traditional approach of the developers, writers and teachers. A private board of Karachi, is using the pictorial approach to construct knowledge and then further analyses it. Therefore, their standard is better. They have further categorized their objectives into specific learning objectives. It is the boards own negligence.

4 Recommendations for attaining the set curriculum objectives

It is recommended that the textbook of Pakistan Studies should be re-written. Its content should have a linkage with the society and the practice. Secondly, the authors of the re-written textbooks should be given the training of education foundation. Thirdly, after the completion of the textbook, before sending it out in the market, the textbook should be first pilot tested and evaluated by the

Pakistan Studies subject experts, educational psychologist and those religious scholars who are in favor of the Pakistan movement. The objectives should be known to the teachers as well as the students. Furthermore, in the exams, matter should be assessed, in fact, the objectives to be assessed. Test of thinking to be done. This should be assessed that what the student perceive and think about Pakistan in the future. Moreover, after every two years, researches should be conducted to check whether the objectives are being achieved or not. Review committees should be set to improve the quality of the matter selected for the content.

5 Conclusion

At the end of the content analysis research of the Pakistan Studies textbook, it can be concluded that the textbook contains a lot of flaws in it. Pakistan Studies, being one of the most important and most beautiful subjects for the citizens of Pakistan is being dealt in the worst way. The problems are not only in the textbook of Pakistan Studies, but in every aspect ranging from the curriculum development till its final implications. Transference of objectives, teacher training, printing and publication, teaching methodology and finally the assessment criteria; all areas have defects within them which needs urgent notification. Therefore due to all these issues the quality and standard of the subject is affected badly.

References

- Chaudry, A. (2010). The myths about pakistan studies. *The Lahore Journal of Economics*, 15.
- Durrani, A. (2009). *Pakistani lingual aspect of national integration of pakistan.national language authority: Islamabad*. Pakistan ministry of education curriculum review.
- Hashmi, K. (2011). An analytical study on issues, challenges and reforms in the pakistan studies curriculum of secondary level. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Education*, 1(3).
- Hussain, S. S. (1983). *Creation of pakistan*. Rawalpindi Army Book Club.
- Ibad, K. R. (2012). *Impact of political culture on political development of baluchistan* (PhD Thesis).
- Jalal, A. (1994). The sole spokesman: Jinnah, the muslim league and the demand for pakistan. cambridge. *South Asian Studies*.
- Jalal, A. (2009). *Partisans of allah: Jihad in south asia*. Harvard University Press.
- Kazimi, M. R. (2009). *A concise history of pakistan*. Oxford University Press.
- Khan, K. (2010). Alamzeb umerzai and his political career until his martyrdom. *Pakistan Study centre*.
- Khawaja, A. (2011). Relevance, evaluation and development of peace and conflict studies in pakistan. *Adenauer Sifting*.
- Marsh, E. E., & White, M. D. (2006). Content analysis: A flexible methodology. *Library trends*, 55(1), 22–45.
- Naseem, B. (2005). Problems faced by female education in co-education. *Pakistan Study Centre*.
- National curriculum of pakistan studies grade ix and x*. (2006). Government of Pakistan Ministry of Education Islamabad.
- Sadiq, K. G. (2005). *Analysis of difficulties faced in the teaching of pakistan studies in nwfp* (Published Thesis).
- Saqib, E. (2004). *Pakistan affairs*. Dogar Publisher, Lahore.
- Shahid, S. M. (2007). *The history of south asia*. Munir Publications, Lahore.