

Copyright © 2020 by Academic Publishing House Researcher s.r.o.



Published in the Slovak Republic
Media Education (Mediaobrazovanie)
Has been issued since 2005
ISSN 1994-4160
E-ISSN 2729-8132
2020, 60(4): 664-674

DOI: 10.13187/me.2020.4.664
www.ejournal53.com



Advertiser Pressure: A Climate Change Content Agenda-Cutting Paradox in Pakistani Media

Rashid Ali Khuhro ^{a, *}, Hamed Bin Mohd Adnan ^b, Zaffar Iqbal Junejo ^c, Mohsin Hassan Khan ^d

^a CRDC, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan

^b University of Malaya, Malaysia

^c Sohail University, Karachi, Sindh, Pakistan

^d School of Media and Communication Studies, University of Management and Technology Lahore, Pakistan

Abstract

Mass media is a part of the political economy and operates like other businesses in the market economy to earn profits. Though, media sells its content as a commodity to the customers and its consumption decides its rating and circulation figures. In that context, the figures attract advertisers to advertise their products through these highly rated and circulated media outlets. However, most of the revenue of any media organisation is gathered through advertisements. Thus, most of them became dependent on advertisers for revenue generation and it generates 'extramedia influence' on media content, which is called advertiser pressure. Therefore, with this background, the fundamental objective of this study is to explore advertiser pressure on climate change content in the media in Pakistan. The data was collected through qualitative semi-structured in-depth interviews from purposively sampled 15 environmental journalists who are working for local and mainstream Pakistani press/media. Findings revealed that advertisers' pressure influences all types of content in the media in Pakistani media. However, advertiser pressure impacts more on climate change content because it is a soft news subject and needs more investment. Additionally, results showed that government advertisers influence more than corporations because the government is the primary advertisers for media content in Pakistan.

Keywords: media influences, external influences, advertiser pressure, pakistani media, climate change.

1. Introduction

The mass media in Pakistan, like other countries of the world, is part of the political economy. It operates like normal businesses in the market, with the agenda to earn profits (Demorest, 2009). However, in a two-sided market (Abbring, Van Ours, 1994), the commodity media offers to the customers is the content. Though, the consumption of media content decides its rating and circulation figures.

Nevertheless, the consumers of media content pay the price through industrial products, which is already included in the consumers' retail price. The advertisers purchase time and space of the highly circulated print media and highly rated broadcast media. That is why the media

* Corresponding author

E-mail addresses: hamed@um.edu.my (H.B. Mohd Adnan); rashid.khuhro@usindh.edu.pk (R.A. Khuhro)

organisations design content acceptable to the audience and readers (Musa, 1996). All those issues are disappeared from media content which is unacceptable to the users of the specific media. This phenomenon is called advertiser pressure on media content (Colistra, 2008; 2012; 2014; 2018; Shoemaker, Reese, 1996, 2013).

The scholars revealed that news is a business that depends on high ratings and advertising revenue for survival (Demorest, 2009). However, the mass media gets revenue through selling space and airtime to potential advertisers. Therefore, the media organisations design content suitable to the consumers (Musa, 1996), which increases circulation and rating figures. Nevertheless, the circulation and rating data of media content are determined to attract advertisers (Dunn et al., 1990; Lacher, Rotfeld, 1994). Indeed, these figures entice advertisers to advertise their products in the media outlets having higher circulation and rating figures.

Further, the existence of media in the market is possible with the support of advertising (Herd, 1952). Thus, the advertising provides a portion of revenue for operations and running of modern mass media of all types of print and broadcast media such as newspapers, magazines, radio, and television (Croteau, Hoynes, 2013). The studies showed that newspapers have prominent features which differentiate them from other regular commodities (Gaunt, 1990; Reddaway, 1963). First, newspapers are sold on two different markets; copies are sold to readers, and advertising space is sold to advertisers (Abbring, Van Ours, 1994). In that context, to increase their circulations, newspapers had to be cheap and exciting (DeLorme, Fedler, 2005). Thus, when newspapers become cheap, readers can buy it easily. It increases the subscription and circulation figures of those cheap newspapers. According to Musa (Musa, 1996), newspapers and magazine sales cannot sustain and ensure the continued existence of media houses without advertising revenues.

Furthermore, the advertisements' revenue is a significant source for broadcasters, too (Byrd-Bredbenner, 2002; Kotz, Story, 1994; Kunkel, Gantz, 1992; Lando, 2013; Osei-Hwere, 2011). However, previous studies indicate that corporate media heavily rely on funds. Therefore, newspapers with fewer circulations face challenging to survive on sales of newspaper copies (Arthur, 2010).

Presently, studies suggest that climate change has continued to be a significant international issue during this century (Wyss, 2019). It has got vital media attention globally as compared to other issues (Hiles, Hinnant, 2014; Ward, 2008). Though, the climate change became prominent in the media after the organisation of the Rio de Janeiro Earth Summit (1992) organised by the United Nations Framework Convention Climate Change (UNFCCC). It has remained in the media discourse for the last three decades (Anderson, 2009; Boykoff, 2014; Hart, Feldman, 2014; Ungar, 2014). However, most often, the coverage of this issue remains unstable. Sometimes, it goes high in media reporting, and suddenly it drops down from the media scene. The other studies have exposed that there is a decline in the coverage of climate in developed and developing countries (Kakonge, 2013; Shanahan, 2009; Takahashi, Meisner, 2012). The reason behind is that the media houses consider it a soft issue, thus pays less attention to it.

Additionally, the media has become a trade that heavily relies on high ratings or circulation and advertising revenue (Demorest, 2009). Though, in the trade, the mass media gets their share by selling space and airtime to the potential advertisers. Therefore, the media organisations design content in such a way as it could be acceptable to the audience and reader (Musa, 1996). Nevertheless, hard issues get more coverage in the media and soft issues like climate change are cutoff from media content. However, the objective of this study is to explore advertiser pressure on climate change content on Pakistani media. It follows the research question (i) *How does advertiser pressure influences on climate change content on the Pakistani media?*

2. Materials and methods

In this qualitative study, the researchers collected data through semi-structured in-depth interviews. However, following the objective of this study, the environmental journalists working for the Pakistani media organisation were considered as a population for this study. In this regard, researchers purposively selected 15 journalists, working on environment beats in local and mainstream media in Pakistan. These environmental journalists were selected from the areas/cities of Pakistan, which likely bear the impacts of climate change. These are Karachi, Lahore, Islamabad, Hyderabad, Quetta, Tharparkar, Badin, Dadu, and Gilgit-Baltistan.

Besides, there is a lack of demographic data and studies about journalists in general and environmental journalists, mainly. That is why researchers did phone calls to media organisations and got contact information about the journalists, who are working on the environment beat. The researcher compiled a list of 21 environmental journalists and conducted in-depth interviews from 17 respondents through a semi-structured open-ended questionnaire guide. It followed the open-ended questionnaire standards. The participants were contacted through email, phone calls, and face to face interviews were also conducted. The researchers conducted a maximum of one and a half hours and a minimum of half-hour in-depth interviews from the participants. These interviews were recorded with the help of recording device, transcribed and translated into the English language. Most of the journalists responded into Sindhi and Urdu languages.

3. Discussion

Nowadays, the news media has become stable and significant business. In that context, Demorest (Demorest, 2009) examined that news is a business that is dependent on the higher ratings or circulation figures, and advertising revenue is one of the lead sources for its survival. Though, it is a reality that advertisements are a primary source of income for the press (Lando, 2013). Most of the revenue of the operation of any media organisation is gathered from advertisements. The existence of media in the market is possible only because the corporate world supports and issues the advertisements (Herd, 1952).

Further, advertising is one of the essential strengths which supports the operations of modern mass media. It assures a central portion of revenue for all types of media such as newspapers, magazines, radio, and television (Croteau, Hoynes, 2013). It is understood that corporate media heavily rely on funds which comes through the advertisements. Therefore, newspapers with fewer circulations are of the view that is challenging for them to survive only on sales of newspaper copies (Arthur, 2010). Thus, the media's chase for advertising income has made them organizationally reliant on corporate. Consequently, news content is restricted (Bagdikian, 1997; Baldasty, 1992; Barnhurst, Nerone, 2002; McChesney, 1999).

Furthermore, Sut (Sut, 1990) argued that instead of the audience, the news itself is the primary commodity that media produce and sell to the advertisers. Media organisations derive their revenue from two markets: a consumer market for media products and an advertising market (Mantrala, Naik, Sridhar, Thorson, 2007) in which access to an audience is sold to advertisers (Rinallo, Basuroy, 2009). In that reciprocal relationship, media sells content to consumers as well as "eyeballs" to advertisers (De Smet, Vanormelingen, 2011). Advertising affects news content by encouraging the media to target the readers most valued by advertisers (Ellman, Germano, 2009).

Typically, the advertisers in media markets, "subsidised" the newspaper reading and television watching for the consumers. i.e., they can consume the media content for free or for a price substantially below the cost to produce the content (Chandra, Collard- Wexler, 2009). The foregone profits are made up of advertising revenue, which is proportionally linked with the increasing the number of consumers (De Smet, Vanormelingen, 2011). That is why content is generated to serve the interests of both parties' interests (Haley, Cunningham, 2003). In the two-sided market (Argentesi, Filistrucchi, 2007) media organisations generate content according to the needs of the consumers to show advertisers higher circulation and rating figures (Gaunt, 1990; Mantrala et al., 2007; Reddaway, 1963).

However, the corporations pay handsomely for large audiences with the "right" (most profitable) demographic characteristics. Progressively, editors work with their business clients and employ marketing studies and techniques to develop content that attracts the audience (Doug, 1993). Similarly, studies elaborated that newspaper journalism is geared toward supporting the newspaper's advertising department. Advertising sales executives serve on strategy committees, along with editors and writers, to determine what readers want and how to attract advertisers (An, Bergen, 2007; Risser, 2000).

Moreover, McChesney (McChesney, 1999) argued that relying on advertising revenue halts the diversity of media content. With declining newspaper circulation and increasing intermedia competition for advertising dollars and sales departments at newspapers experience rising pressure from advertisers (An, Bergen, 2007). Thus, advertising influence potentially leads to inadequate coverage of important issues. In our critical examples, the impact may have serious consequences, for instance, in health, the environment, and even voter participation (Ellman, Germano, 2009).

Press (Press, 2010) reports that 85 % of the journalists are of the view that "objectivity of journalism is under increasing influence from advertisers, marketers, and owners."

Additionally, a potential result of advertiser influence is that commercial news media can fail to provide citizens with the news they needed to make themselves informed for taking the political decisions. Lacking accurate and unbiased information on business practices, citizens and their representatives might fail to craft legislation to hold businesses accountable for their actions. Thus, the public's information deficit can undermine the efficiency of democratic political institutions and impair the practice of self-government (Poitras, Sutter, 2009).

Besides, to some extent the media play a decisive role in the political decision-making process, Smith's remarks also highlight some of our concerns, namely, that advertiser-funded media may fail to provide adequate coverage on specific issues of concern to society (Germano, Meier, 2010). The correctness of information generates many externalities on society. Many decisions, be it voting, consumption, or investment, are based on information retrieved from newspapers. Therefore, newspaper owners and editors should not allow advertisers or the advertisement departments to attempt to influence editorial content (De Smet, Vanormelingen, 2012).

In the political economy of mass media, there are certain internal and external factors (extramedia, organisational, and within-media), which affects the content (Colistra, 2008; 2012; 2014; 2018; Shoemaker, Reese, 1996; 2013). However, Colistra (Colistra, 2008) has further divided these into three influences in the sub-categories of external and internal pressures in a theoretical model of Influences on Media Content (IOMC). According to Rita F. Colistra's (Colistra, 2008) IOMC model reveals that extramedia influence is divided into three sub-categories. These are advertiser pressure, public relations pressure, and political pressure. However, organisational influence is divided into further sub-categories, such as ownership pressure, economic pressure, and executive pressure. Though within-media influences staff size creates direct and indirect management pressure. However, another pressure which comes under content influences is market size pressure. According to Colistra (Colistra, 2018) IOMC model, these external and internal influences affect media to build an agenda and also build a frame about the content of an issue.

However, this research article has restricted itself to discuss only one extramedia influence, i.e., advertiser pressure. It creates pressure on media organisations to design content according to the needs of media users with a purpose to generate more advertising revenue. That is why those issues remain in focus, which is in demand from users, and those who are not in demand are downplayed or cutoff from media content. Nevertheless, hard issues get more coverage in the media and soft issues like climate change are cutoff from media content. However, the objective of this study is to explore advertiser pressure on climate change content on Pakistani media. It follows the research question (i) *How does advertiser pressure influences on climate change content on the Pakistani media?*

4. Results

This study discusses the advertising pressure on climate change contents in Pakistani media. With this objective, the data has gathered in the form of audio recordings. Further, the researchers have analysed the data by using thematic analysis method. It is a qualitative data analysis method. The findings are presented below regarding the advertiser pressure on climate change content. The results reveal that the advertiser pressure is a reality for all types of media content in Pakistan. Participant-A describes it:

"I would cite here the example of the Thar Coal Power Project; it is the project of Engro (A fertiliser tycoon in Pakistan). It will be completed in 2019. Now it is tough to criticise these giants. No matter how significant information do you have in your story. But not many newspapers are willing to take such hard-hitting stories of journalists. Because they are afraid to lose advertisement from Engro. It is one of the significant advertisers of media houses in Pakistan. Though I am not their employee, it is likely they would play down my story. Probably they might have good terms with the organisation. That is why they would ask me not to go for coverage. If I reported it, then they have options to downplay it" (Participant-A)."

Further, most of the respondents expressed a similar notion of the influence of advertisers on the media content. Participant-B has also told a similar story:

"I strongly feel that the media's whole business runs through advertising. It could not affect survival. It is difficult without advertising revenue... I must say here that media supports the

content which serves its economic interests. If the media house sees, the content will affect their advertisements, they put it in the dustbin, without giving it a second thought. Climate change is not the subject that would help them to hunt advertising revenue. That is why I would say it is one of the major pressures on the content of climate change. Advertiser pressure has the potential to affect to cut or downplay climate change coverage (Participant-B).

Moreover, many of the respondents informed that the cost of media content production is more than its retail price, which it gets through subscriptions of airtime or copy price. Participant-C shares in details:

"It is the reality that the media is dependent on advertising revenue. For example, Daily Dawn, the retail price is from 15 to 20 Pakistani Rupees per paper. However, according to my knowledge, a single per-copy production cost is more than 40 Rupees. Now we must understand that from where the remaining money comes. It comes through advertisers. That is why advertising pressure influences all types of content, including climate change (Participant-C)."

Likewise, Participant-L also elaborates:

"If I am not mistaken, advertising is the only source of income for the media. For newspapers, at certain point, they can generate revenue through the sale of the paper. But this is not enough. The amount these organisations collect through newspaper circulation cannot fulfill the cost of production of the paper. That is why media organisations depend on advertising to run the financial affairs. Without advertisement, they cannot survive. For example, if any media group loses its advertising revenue, it would shut off its operation within a few days (Participant L)."

Additionally, findings showed that in the political economy, media organisations in Pakistan also must sell content to the consumers to run business and to earn more profit. Thus, in the two-sided market, it creates pressure on media organisations to design content according to the needs of media users to generate more advertising revenue. That is why those issues remain in focus which is in demand from users, and those who are not in demand are downplayed or cutoff from media content.

Besides, results revealed that media in Pakistan is always busy with the coverage of hard issues such as terrorism, crime, politics, and economics. However, the soft issues attract less to the media executives and masses as well. Thus, the soft news stories are downplayed deliberately by the editors. It has been done to serve personal interests and to generate more revenue. In that context, Participant-L explained:

"For media organisations in Pakistan, climate change and environmental issues are soft news. They think it is not saleable. However, it costs a lot of funds to collect stories related to the subject. However, it gets less attention from the masses. If any media organisation loses its readers and audience, indeed, it will lose advertising too (Participant-L)."

Additionally, the findings explored that advertising pressure impacts all types of media content, including climate change. It is one of the significant pressures on the media's content about climate change in the Pakistani press. The pressure is a reality for all kinds of media such as national, local, small, large, ethnic, and religious and including those owned by the government too. Participant D, working for local Sindhi language newspapers shares:

"I remember when I was working on the farmers' issues in my region. I was very much interested in the impacts of pesticides on the farmers and the environment. I always investigated the issue. At that time, I was invited to a meeting with farmers, organised by a pesticide corporation. It was intended to aware of farmers about different pesticide products of the company. When their representative introduced a pesticide product, I raised my hand and inquired 'Are you talking about the product, with particular formula?' He said 'yes, I do.' I was in shock to learn that the government of Pakistan and other countries around the globe had banned that product. I asked him, how could you advise farmers on the usage of such a dangerous product which has harmful effects for humans and the environment and prohibited by the government? They interrupted me and ended the session in the halfway. After that, they were looking at me suspiciously, as I was a blackmailer or a thief. Then they called my editor to kick me out of the job. The editor denied. So, the company threatened to withdraw all advertisements given by their company. Then the editor settled the issue through dialogue with the company head (Participant-D)."

Though, the above example is the clear evidence of advertiser pressure on the local media in Pakistan. Similarly, Participant E who is also part of local small media organisation shares that:

"In small media organisations, the journalists have to accomplish both tasks; make news stories and collect advertisements. It makes the journalist more partial to report different issues. For example, if any company is giving advertisements to the media through reporters. Now, the reporters are bound to see whether to report them or not. However, the fear of losing ads stops reporters from reportage of many issues in local and small media houses. Though reporters are not paid salaries by their employers. They earn a commission from ads which they collect for their organisations. Thus, denial from collecting ads makes them prone to lose jobs. So, because of the financial interests of media organisations in the shape of advertisements, climate change coverage suffers (Participant E)."

Further, findings revealed another interesting phenomenon that the primary advertiser for the Pakistani media come from the government departments and the industry. Indeed, both stakeholders are somehow associated with the issue of climate change. On the one side, the government is giving less attention to tackle problems related to climate change impacts. The reportage of corruption scandals of the government representatives in climate change-related projects and rehabilitation work after natural disasters by media annoys them. Thus, governments stop advertising in the media. On the other side, industries are significant greenhouse gases producers and environmental pollution. Now if the media starts reporting these issues. These industries pull out advertisements from the media houses.

Furthermore, according to findings, the government is the primary source of advertisement for the media in Pakistan. Though, the media generates 90% of its revenue through ads received from the government departments. That is why the first pressure on media comes from the government departments. The media cannot present content against the policies of the government. If media disseminate news against the government, then the government might take away its advertisement from the press. Participant-J shares that:

"I am always advised by the Editor-in-Chief to give top coverage to the government-related stories, which include day to day policies. Lead and second lead space are always specified for Prime Minister and Chief Minister's humdrum statements. The environment has nothing to do with the business of the newspaper owners. They only know how to get more and more advertisements by appeasing the Public Relations Offices of the government. Advertisements are also bought on certain percentages by the newspaper owners. Journalism has degenerated into a shabby business which as a prime concern only—minting money by any means, fair or foul (Participant-J)."

Further, participant B explains a similar situation:

"I make stories for local organisations. In fact, the government is a primary sponsor for these local media houses. That is why; most the local media houses would not publish anything against government officials and local politicians. If they publish, they might lose advertising. For instance, I have filed a big number of stories about deforestation. I have written against local government officials and politicians that they are in partnerships, and they are instrument in leasing forest land for agriculture purposes. They destroy forests to make land cultivatable. They have cut 85% of forests on the right and left banks of Indus River. We could relate deforestation with government officials and local politicians. That is why media houses do not publish stories against government officials to serve their personal interests. However, if they would post these stories, these government officials and politicians will pull out their advertisements from these organisations. It would deteriorate the financial condition of these media houses. There is a possibility that they would close their operations because of financial losses (Participant-B)."

Moreover, Participant-I also shares a similar experience while reporting about government:

"I must mention my story about Nuclear Power plant installations in Karachi. I sent it to the Daily Express Tribune. They did not carry it because of their editorial policy. In that story, I had written about the consequences of the installation of a Nuclear Power Plant based on Chinese supported technology near to one of the world's most populated city Karachi. I mentioned in the story that the project is not safe for the people of the city. The Express Tribune denied to publish it because they thought the government would act against them and may pull out all advertisements. The fact is that the government is a major advertiser for media in Pakistan. That is why the media does not want to take the risk. So, I must agree that advertising pressure affects climate change a lot (Participant-I)."

Besides, results revealed that the media in Pakistan also depend on industries or corporations for advertisements. Though most of these industries are producers of Greenhouse

Gases and pollution. Nevertheless, there are many objective stories about these industries. For example, in Pakistan, most of the companies do not follow international safety measures given by the government to save the environment and people from the harmful effects of pollution. The companies do not adopt proper environmental safety precautions. Media managers do not allow journalists to make stories about these corporations. The Participant-I has a similar opinion:

"Advertiser pressure affects climate change coverage more than any other restriction. Though, the reason behind that most of the advertisers are those industries that hold a significant share in the production of Greenhouse Gases. Not only that but they are polluting rivers and creating problems like air pollutions for the country. The wastage extracted from these industries impacts thousands of lives every year. These industries do not take safety measures to protect the environment and the populations settled near the surroundings of their plants. If any media organisation starts covering these issues such as climate change and pollution. Simply, these industries would pull out their advertisement revenue. However, reporting on climate change and the environment could make media organisations bankrupt. That is why media organisations avoid reporting issues such as climate change. The fear of losing advertising revenue is affecting coverage of climate change (Participant-I)."

Moreover, nowadays, under the China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) pact between China and Pakistan, China is shifting its coal industry towards Pakistan. Participant-F shares his observation about it:

"Pakistan has signed many pacts with China under China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) to set the coal industry for Energy Generation Sector. China is one of the biggest greenhouse gasses emitters. The country is under pressure by the world to shift their Coal Industry to alternate energy resources. Though they are not ready to do it. After this pact between both countries, China is shifting its coal industry to Pakistan. Nevertheless, Pakistan is one of the fewer contributors to GHGs around the world. This act would make it one of the bigger GHGs emitters. It needs to be reported in the media. However, because of the fear of losing advertisement, media houses are trying to let it go (Participant-F)."

Additionally, from the findings, it is evident that corporations also discourage journalists from reporting against them. If journalists sustain pressure and report without any fear when the companies ask editors to withdraw stories against them. If editors deny, then these corporations stop giving advertisements. Participant-H, who is working for mainstream media, shares a similar experience:

"For example, the Sugar Industry exists in rural areas. It does not have proper waste management policies. It does not have waste treatment plants. The waste is creating environmental issues. It affects health and increases greenhouses in the atmosphere. However, the journalists in these areas cannot report because politicians own most of the sugar mills. If you report, politicians become angry. They are advertisers too. They take away advertising from media organisations (Participant H)."

Finally, the results revealed that owing to the fear of losing the advertisement form industry and the government departments, the media cut or downplay stories about climate change. Thus, it is evident from the findings that the advertiser pressure influences all types of content in Pakistan, including climate change.

5. Conclusion

In response to the objective of this study "to explore advertising pressure on climate change content in Pakistani media," the results revealed that the advertiser pressure is a reality for all types of media content in Pakistan. It is the endorsement of previous studies (DeLorme, Fedler, 2005; Lando, 2013). Though, the media practitioners in Pakistan consider climate change a soft subject. Nevertheless, the media is always busy with the coverage of hard issues such as terrorism, crime, politics, and economics. Thus, soft issues like climate change require more investment and are less catchy for audiences and readers and even for advertisers too. Hard news is resulting largely from pre-scheduled or unscheduled 'events', although soft news is intended to 'fill a hole' when prescheduled stories are deficient (Glogger, 2019; Makki, 2020). That is why these issues are less salient for media and are downplayed or cutoff from the media agenda.

According to previous studies that newspapers had to be inexpensive to increase their circulations (DeLorme, Fedler, 2005). In that context, findings have shown that the cost price of content produced by the media is more than the retail price on which it is sold to the consumers

(Hill, 2016). In that context, an environmental journalist shared that in comparison to the retail price of *Daily Dawn* (a leading English language daily in Pakistan), the cost production is double. Likewise, most of the participants have risen a similar concern. That is why the newspaper could not rely on the revenue collected from the subscription. Though, in the context of electronic media, there is no option of subscription. It must depend totally on advertising revenue.

Further, as mentioned by Demorest (Demorest, 2009) advertising is the primary source of earning and survival for media. It is the same situation for media organisations in Pakistan. Though, the dependency of media organisations on advertising revenue builds advertiser pressure on the media content generally and specifically on climate change content. Nonetheless, An & Bergen, 2007 (An, Bergen, 2007) revealed that advertising directors are ready to appease their advertisers, and are also ready to respond to advertisers' requests positively. Similarly, findings explored that Pakistani journalists believe that climate change coverage is cutoff or downplayed in the media because of advertiser pressure. It is against media houses' interest to give prominence to soft news, which directly affects their advertising revenue.

Furthermore, according to scholars, newspapers with small circulations are less financially stable and more constrained by competition than newspapers with large circulations (Bagdikian, 1987; Blankenburg, 1983; Demers, 1996, 1998). In contrast with mainstream newspapers' economies of scale, small-circulation newspapers have smaller revenue bases and a limited pool of local advertisers (Soley, Craig, 1992). In that context, findings revealed that advertiser pressure is a reality for all types of media such as national, local, small, large, ethnic, and religious and including those owned by the government.

Additionally, findings exhibited that the government is the primary advertiser for Pakistani media. Media generates 90 percent of its revenue through government advertisements. Thus, the first pressure to the Pakistani press comes from government departments. Though, the Pakistani press cannot present content against the policies of the government. If media circulate news against the government, it stops giving advertisements. So, journalists could not write against government advertisers. If they do, they must face hardships.

Besides, findings show that after government advertisements, the Pakistani press also heavily relies on industries or corporations for advertisements (Berganza, 2019). Though most of these industries are producers of Greenhouse Gases and pollution, however, the Pakistani press could not report against these companies. If any media do, the corporations pull out advertisements from media the houses. Nowadays, under the China Pakistan Economic Corridor pact between China and Pakistan, China is shifting its coal industry towards Pakistan. The corporations also discourage journalists from reporting against them.

Moreover, advertiser pressure influences directly and indirectly on Pakistani media content (Colistra, 2018). Though, in small organisations, journalists have collect advertisements for their organisations. Therefore, they they are conscious to report against their advertisers. Thus, advertiser pressure in small organisations impacts directly on the journalists. However, in mainstream media organisations, most of the time, this pressure comes indirectly. The advertiser of mainstream media does not contact directly to reporters. They pursue or threat the management to avoid reporting regarding them.

Finally, the results revealed that owing to the fear of losing the advertisement from the industry and the government departments. The media cut or downplay stories having significant aspects of climate change. Thus, advertising pressure influences all types of content, including climate change. It is one of the foremost reasons for agenda-cutting for Pakistani media.

Though the purpose of this study was to explore the advertiser pressure on climate change content in Pakistani media. It is concluded that advertisers' pressure being extra-media influence has a significant impact on climate change content in the Pakistani media. It has been explored that this pressure is a reality for all kinds of content and all kinds of media equally in the country. In that context, findings revealed that the Pakistani press relies on the advertising revenue for survival. Being a part of political economy media also compete for the profits.

Thus, content in Pakistani media is designed to increase subscription and ratings. Nevertheless, climate change is a soft subject, that is why it is less catchy for the advertisers and media too. Therefore, advertisers' pressure becomes the main reason for agenda-cutting of climate change reporting in both mainstream and local media.

Further, findings found another reason that Pakistani media is highly dependent on government advertisement revenue. Though most of the climate change-related issues are associated with the government. So, the government does not like to be criticised in this context.

Therefore, most of the media organisations are conscious about reporting against the government. In sum, they do not want to lose advertisement revenue received from the government.

Nonetheless, corporations are also advertisers of the Pakistani press. Although, these are these industries are primary emitters and polluters, the owners of these industries also do not like a criticism from the media. Thus, the corporations' advertisers pressurise media organisations for not covering the stories about them. If they do, they lose advertisement revenue. The research article concludes that advertiser pressure influences climate change reporting in the Pakistani media. It becomes reason for agenda cutting (Wober, 2001, 2002) of climate change content in the Pakistani press. In the future, the studies should be conducted to investigate other issues to get further insights about the advertisers' pressure on media content in Pakistan.

References

- Abbring, Van Ours, 1994 – Abbring, J.H., Van Ours, J.C. (1994). Selling news and advertising space: The economics of Dutch newspapers. *De Economist*. 142(2): 151-170.
- An, Bergen, 2007 – An, S., Bergen, L. (2007). Advertiser pressure on daily newspapers: A survey of advertising sales executives. *Journal of Advertising*. 36(2): 111-121.
- Anderson, 2009 – Anderson, A. (2009). Media, Politics and Climate Change: Towards a new research agenda. *Sociology Compass*. 3(2): 166-182. doi:10.1111/j.1751-9020.2008.00188.x
- Argentesi, Filistrucchi, 2007 – Argentesi, E., Filistrucchi, L. (2007). Estimating market power in a two- sided market: The case of newspapers. *Journal of Applied Econometrics*. 22(7): 1247-1266.
- Arthur, 2010 – Arthur, P. (2010). Democratic consolidation in Ghana: The role and contribution of the media, civil society and state institutions. *Commonwealth & Comparative Politics*. 48(2): 203-226.
- Bagdikian, 1987 – Bagdikian, B.H. (1987). *The Media Monopoly* (2nd ed.). Boston: Beacon Press.
- Bagdikian, 1997 – Bagdikian, B.H. (1997). *The media monopoly*. 5-th ed. Boston, MA: Beacon.
- Baldasty, 1992 – Baldasty, G.J. (1992). *The commercialization of news in the nineteenth century*: University of Wisconsin Pres.
- Barnhurst, Nerone, 2002 – Barnhurst, K.G., Nerone, J. (2002). *The form of news: A history*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Berganza, 2019 – Berganza, R. (2019). Government Coverage. In *The International Encyclopedia of Journalism*. John Wiley & Sons: 1-9.
- Blankenburg, 1983 – Blankenburg, W.B. (1983). A newspaper chain's pricing behavior. *Journalism Quarterly*. 60(2): 275-280.
- Boykoff, 2014 – Boykoff, M.T. (2014). Commentary: Media discourse on the climate slowdown. *Nature Climate Change*. 4(3): 156-158. doi:10.1038/nclimate2156
- Byrd- Bredbenner, 2002 – Byrd- Bredbenner, C. (2002). Saturday morning children's television advertising: a longitudinal content analysis. *Family and Consumer Sciences Research Journal*. 30(3): 382-403.
- Chandra, Collard- Wexler, 2009 – Chandra, A., Collard- Wexler, A. (2009). Mergers in two- sided markets: An Application to the Canadian newspaper industry. *Journal of Economics & Management Strategy*. 18(4): 1045-1070.
- Colistra, 2008 – Colistra, R. F. (2008). Reporter perceptions of influences on media content: A structural equation model of the agenda-and frame-building and agenda-cutting processes in the television industry. (PhD), University of North Carolina, Chapel Hil.
- Colistra, 2012 – Colistra, R.F. (2012). Shaping and cutting the media agenda: Television reporters' perceptions of agenda-and frame-building and agenda-cutting influences. *Journalism & Communication Monographs*. 14(2): 85-146.
- Colistra, 2014 – Colistra, R.F. (2014). Are advertisers potential (and effective) influencers on news content? An examination of TV reporters' perceptions of extramedia pressures on media content and coverage decisions. *Electronic News*. 8(2): 83-100.

- Colistra, 2018** – Colistra, R.F. (2018). Power pressures and pocketbook concerns: Perceptions of organizational influences on news content in the television industry. *International Journal of Communication*. 12: 21.
- Croteau, Hoynes, 2013** – Croteau, D., Hoynes, W. (2013). Media/society: Industries, images, and audiences. Sage Publications.
- De Smet, Vanormelingen, 2011** – De Smet, D., Vanormelingen, S. (2011). Advertiser pressure on newspaper journalists: A Survey. *Economics & Management*.
- De Smet, Vanormelingen, 2012** – De Smet, D., Vanormelingen, S. (2012). The advertiser is mentioned twice. Media bias in Belgian newspapers. *Economics & Management*. 1-30.
- DeLorme, Fedler, 2005** – DeLorme, D.E., Fedler, F. (2005). An Historical Analysis of Journalists' Attitudes toward Advertisers and Advertising's Influence. *American Journalism*, 22(2): 7-40.
- Demers, 1996** – Demers, D. (1996). Corporate newspaper structure, editorial page vigor, and social change. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*. 73(4): 857-877.
- Demers, 1998** – Demers, D. (1998). Revisiting corporate newspaper structure and profit making. *Journal of media economics*. 11(2): 19-45.
- Demorest, 2009** – Demorest, J. A. (2009). Corporate interests and their impact on news coverage. *The Institute for Applied & Professional Ethics Archives*. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.ohio.edu/ethics/2001-conferences/corporate-interests-and-their-impact-on-news-coverage/>
- Doug, 1993** – Doug, U. (1993). When MBAs rule the newsroom: How the marketers and managers are reshaping today's media. In. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Dunn, et al., 1990** – Dunn, S.W., Barban, A.M., Krugman, D., Reid, L.N. (1990). Advertising: its role in modern marketing. Hinsdale, IL: The Dryden Press.
- Ellman, Germano, 2009** – Ellman, M., Germano, F. (2009). What do the papers sell? A model of advertising and media bias. *The Economic Journal*. 119(537): 680-704.
- Gaunt, 1990** – Gaunt, P. (1990). Choosing the news: The profit factor in news selection (Vol. 16): Praeger Pub Text.
- Germano, Meier, 2010** – Germano, F., Meier, M. (2010). Concentration and self-censorship in commercial media. *Journal of Public Economics*. 97: 117-130.
- Glogger, 2019** – Glogger, I. (2019). Soft spot for soft news? Influences of journalistic role conceptions on hard and soft news coverage. *Journalism Studies*. 20(16): 2293-2311.
- Haley, Cunningham, 2003** – Haley, E., Cunningham, A. (2003). Readers' perspectives on advertising's influence in women's magazines: thoughts on two practices. *Mass Communication & Society*. 6(2): 175-190.
- Hart, Feldman, 2014** – Hart, P. S., Feldman, L. (2014). Threat without efficacy? Climate change on US network news. *Science Communication*. 36(3): 325-351. doi:10.1177/1075547013520239
- Herd, 1952** – Herd, H. (1952). The March of Journalism: The Story of the British Press from 1622 to the Present Day. London: G. Allen & Unwin.
- Hiles, Hinnant, 2014** – Hiles, S.S., Hinnant, A. (2014). Climate change in the newsroom journalists' evolving standards of objectivity when covering global warming. *Science Communication*. 36(4): 1-26. doi:10.1177/1075547014534077
- Hill, 2016** – Hill, J. (2016). Newspaper Production. In *The British Newspaper Industry*. London: Springer: 149-152.
- Kakonge, 2013** – Kakonge, J.O. (2013). Fostering partnerships with media organizations to improve climate change coverage in Africa. *Science Communication*. 35(3): 411-416. doi:10.1177/1075547012464216
- Kotz, Story, 1994** – Kotz, K., Story, M. (1994). Food advertisements during children's Saturday morning television programming: are they consistent with dietary recommendations? *Journal of the Academy of Nutrition and Dietetics*. 94(11): 1296-1300.
- Kunkel, Gantz, 1992** – Kunkel, D., Gantz, W. (1992). Children's television advertising in the multichannel environment. *Journal of Communication*. 42(3): 134-152.
- Lacher, Rotfeld, 1994** – Lacher, K.T., Rotfeld, H.J. (1994). Newspaper policies on the potential merging of advertising and news content. *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*: 281-289.
- Lando, 2013** – Lando, A. (2013). Media ethics in the Kenyan media?: Understanding the disconnect between the classroom and practice. *African Journal of Communication*. 1(1): 14.

- Makki, 2020** – Makki, M. (2020). The role of ‘culture’ in the construction of news values: A discourse analysis of Iranian hard news reports. *Journal of Multicultural Discourses*. 94: 1-17.
- Mantrala et al., 2007** – Mantrala, M.K., Naik, P.A., Sridhar, S., Thorson, E. (2007). Uphill or downhill? Locating the firm on a profit function. *Journal of Marketing*. 71(2): 26-44.
- McChesney, 1999** – McChesney, R.D. (1999). Rich Media, poor democracy – Communication politics in dubious times. *Urbana: University of Illinois Press*.
- Musa, 1996** – Musa, D. (1996). The sleeping dog cannot bark: Media and mass disempowerment of civil society in Africa. *Africa Media Review*. 10: 79-92.
- Osei-Hwere, 2011** – Osei-Hwere, E. (2011). Children's television policy and content diversity in Ghana. *Journal of Children and Media*. 5(01): 69-85.
- Poitras, Sutter, 2009** – Poitras, M., Sutter, D. (2009). Advertiser pressure and control of the news: The decline of muckraking revisited. *Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization*. 72(3): 944-958.
- Reddaway, 1963** – Reddaway, W.B. (1963). The economics of newspapers. *The Economic Journal*. 73(290): 201-218.
- Rinallo, Basuroy, 2009** – Rinallo, D., Basuroy, S. (2009). Does advertising spending influence media coverage of the advertiser? *Journal of Marketing*. 73(6): 33-46.
- Risser, 2000** – Risser, J. (2000). Lessons from LA: The wall is heading back. *Columbia Journalism Review*. 38(5): 26.
- Shanahan, 2009** – Shanahan, M. (2009). Time to adapt? Media coverage of climate change in nonindustrialised countries. In Boyce, T., Lewis, J. (eds.), *Climate Change and the Media*. Vol. 5. London: Peter Lang: 145-157.
- Shoemaker, Reese, 1996** – Shoemaker, P.J., Reese, S.D. (1996). *Mediating the message: Theories of influences on mass media content* (2 ed.). New York, USA: Longman Publishers.
- Shoemaker, Reese, 2013** – Shoemaker, P.J., Reese, S.D. (2013). *Mediating the message in the 21st century: A media sociology perspective*. New York: Routledge.
- Soley, Craig, 1992** – Soley, L.C., Craig, R.L. (1992). Advertising pressures on newspapers: A survey. *Journal of advertising*. 21(4): 1-10.
- Sut, 1990** – Sut, J. (1990). The Codes of advertising: fetishism and the political economy of meaning in the consumer society. In: New York, Routledge.
- Takahashi, Meisner, 2012** – Takahashi, B., Meisner, M. (2012). Climate change in Peruvian newspapers: The role of foreign voices in a context of vulnerability. *Public Understanding of Science*. 22(4): 427-442. doi:10.1177/0963662511431204
- Ungar, 2014** – Ungar, S. (2014). Media context and reporting opportunities on climate change: 2012 versus 1988. *Environmental Communication*. 8(2): 233-248. DOI: 10.1080/17524032.2014.907193
- Ward, 2008** – Ward, B. (2008). Communicating on climate change: An essential resource for journalists, scientists, and educators.
- Wober, 2001** – Wober, J.M. (2001). Agenda-cutting: Some remarks on the phenomenon and its importance. Paper presented at the Media Tenor's Agenda-Setting Conference, Bonn, Germany.
- Wober, 2002** – Wober, J.M. (2002). Agenda cutting: The hidden twin of agenda setting. *Media Tenor Quarterly Journal*. 3(2002): 64-67.
- Wyss, 2019** – Wyss, R. (2019). Reporting climate change In Luce, A. (ed.). *Ethical reporting of sensitive topics*. Chennai, India: Deanta Global Publishing Services.