MORINGA OLEIFERA SEEDS AS A LOW-COST BIOSORBENT FOR REMOVING HEAVY METALS FROM WASTEWATER

Samuel Obeng Apori^{1, 2}, Kofi Atiah², Emmanuel Hanyabui², John Byalebeka³

¹Uganda Martyrs University, Faculty of Agriculture, African Center of Excellence in Agroecology and Livelihood System, Kampala, Uganda, apori.samuel@umu.ac.ug.
²University of Cape Coast, Department of Soil Science, Ghana, Kofi.atiah@ucc.edu.gh, emmanuel.hanyabui@stu.ucc.edu.gh
³ Uganda Martyrs University, Faculty of agriculture, Kampala, Uganda.

REVIEW PAPER

ISSN 2637-2150 e-ISSN 2637-2614 UDK628.193:546.815 DOI: 10.7251/STED20020450

Paper received:19.02.2020.Paper accepted:20.05.2020.Published:26.05.2020.http://stedj-univerzitetpim.com

Corresponding Author:

Samuel Obeng Apori, Uganda Martyrs University, Faculty of Agriculture, African Center of Excellence in Agroecology and Livelihood System, Kampala, Uganda, apori.samuel@umu.ac.ug

Copyright © 2020 Samuel Obeng Apori; published by UNIVERSITY PIM. This work licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 4.

ABSTRACT

Heavy metals are considered to be one of the major contaminants of water in recent years due to their non-biodegradable property; hence making them toxic and bioaccumulate living to organisms. Conventional methods such us chemical precipitation, physical treatment through ion exchange are used for removing heavy metal ions from water. These methods are expensive and attributed to incomplete metals removal and high cost of treatment. In recent years, researchers have found alternative low cost and effective method

for removal of toxic metals through biosorption process using biological materials. Moringa oleifera seeds is one of the biological materials which has effective adsorption capacity for removal of heavy metals from water and wastewater. In this article, the seeds of Moringa oleifera seeds as a low-cost biosorbent for removal of heavy metals is presented. Moringa oleifera seeds is inexpensive material that contains amino acids. The amino acid is a major constituent of the functional groups that aids in greater ability of heavy metals removal through metal ion exchange or complexation, which is mainly affected by pH, biosorbent dosage, and contact time. Moringa oleifera seeds residues have a greater capacity to absorb heavy metals in a single solution compared to multi ion solution.

Keywords: *Moringa oleifera* seeds, biosorbent, heavy metals, amino acids, waste water.

INTRODUCTION

Heavy metals constitute a major group of contaminants of water. They arise from different sources such natural as geochemical and anthropogenic activities (Kumari, Sharma, Srivastava, & Srivastava, 2006). Heavy metals are defined as metallic substances that have a relatively high density (at least 5 gcm⁻³) compared to water (Tchounwou, Yedjou, Patlolla, Sutton, & Luch, 2012). The bases of anthropogenic activities originate from agricultural activities, atmospheric deposition, road run off, discharges from industrial plants and sewage works, acidic mine effluents and building of reservoirs (Sajidu, Henry,

Kwamdera, & Mataka, 2005). Heavy metals are a danger to human life and the environment due to its non-biodegradability compare to organic pollutants making them toxic and persistent in the environment and increasing their concentrations in living systems-bioaccumulation (Adhiambo. Lusweti, & Morang'a, 2015). Metals such as cadmium (Cd), arsenic (As), chromium (Cr), manganese (Mn), copper (Cu), mercury (Hg), nickel (Ni), iron (Fe), zinc (Zn) and lead (Pb) (Jarup, 2003) are found to be toxic to humans and ecological environments even in low concentrations. Table 1 shows some heavy metals and their maximum acceptable concentrations in drinking water set by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). Some of these heavy metals have the potential of being assimilated, stored and concentrated in the human body, resulting in several diseases to the human body. (E.g. central nervous system impairment, kidneys failure, liver disorder) (Verbost, Flik, Pang, Lock, & Bonga, 1989). Therefore, it is of extreme importance to prevent heavy metals from entering drinking water sources by ensuring their removal from wastewater before it is disposed of into the environment. This is a crucial step towards meeting the acceptable concentrations of metals in drinking water such as those set by the EPA and, hence, prevent any potential adverse effects on human health and aquatic life. Over the years, many treatment options like physical, chemical, and biological were implied to remediate heavy metal contaminated soil, water, and sediments. Such methods include thermal treatment, adsorption, chlorination, chemical extraction, ionmembrane exchange, separation. electrokinetics, bioleaching etc (Aruliah et al., 2019). Moringa Oleifera is increasingly becoming a biosorbent in the removal of heavy metal from waste and polluted water. However, some key findings such as dosage, pH and time kinetics have not been explicit. Therefore, this review is to elucidate on these key gaps identified in the literature in order to provide clear and unambiguous end to these issues.

 Table 1. Maximum acceptable concentrations of some heavy metals in drinking water

Element	EPA Limit (mgL ⁻¹)			
Antimony	0.006			
Arsenic	0.010			
Beryllium	0.004			
Chromium (total)	0.100			
Cadmium	0.005			
Cupper	1.300			
Lead	0.015			
Mercury	0.002			
Selenium	0.050			
Silver	0.100			

BIOSORPTION-PREFERRED METHOD FOR HEAVY METALS REMEDIATION OF WASTEWATER

Many methods for heavy metals removal from water and wastewater including chemical precipitation and physical treatment (Singh, Rupainwar, Prasad, & Jayaprakas, 1998) have been studied. These methods are costly and have disadvantages such as incomplete removal of heavy metals, high treatment cost, and generation of secondary waste which are very toxic hence, requiring cautious disposal (Congeevaram, Dhanarani, Park, Dexilin, & Thamaraiselvi, 2007; Apori, Hanyabui, & Asiamah, 2018). Researchers have found an alternative method which is very cheap and efficient in removal of toxic metals through biosorption. Biosorption, which is the removal of heavy metals from water and waste water using biological materials are less costly compared to chemical and physical treatments methods. The Biosorption method depends on the capability of biological materials to remove heavy metals through metal binding by multiple mechanisms such as ion exchange, electrostatic forces and precipitation. Some of the biological methods used for the removal of heavy metals includes trickling filter, biosorption, activated sludge process, and various anaerobic methods. Studies have indicated that Moringa oleifera seed used as a biological material for heavy metals removal from water and waste water has a potent adsorption capacity (Kumari et al., 2006). This review looks at the

botanical classification. morphological, geographical and climatic distribution conditions favoring growth and performance of moringa. Further, mechanisms and models explaining the sorption properties of moringa seeds as biosorbent are discussed in this review.

MORINGA OLEIFERA

Moringa oleifera is one of the 14 species of *Moringa* which is the sole genus of the plant family Moringaceae. Moringa oleifera is originated from western and sub-Himalayan tracts, India, Pakistan, Asia Minor, Africa and Arabia (Mughal, Ali, Srivastava, & Iqbal, 1999) and is a fastgrowing shrub or small tree, attaining a height of 12 meters. It consists of a crown and trunk which is always single. It is well adapted to the semi-arid tropics and subtropics conditions and are highly tolerant to poor soils (da Silva & Kerr, 1999). It is drought tolerant and has nutritional and water purification attributes (Muyibi, Noor, Ong, & Kai, 2001). Moringa oleifera seeds (Figure 1) have been used as adsorbents for removing metal ions due to their good adsorption capacity. Moringa has a wide range of uses including as food, traditional medicine, fodder, and as a living fence (Morton, 1991; Coote, Stewart, & Bonongwe, 1997; Pratt, Henry, Mbeza, Mlaka, & Satali, 2002). Moringa *oleifera* is an important food which is now considered to be a 'natural' nutrition of the tropics. It is highly nutritive and used as vegetable in many countries, particularly in India, Pakistan, Philippines, Hawaii and many parts of Africa (Anwar, & Bhanger, 2003; Anwar, Ashraf, & Bhanger, 2005). The roots are used as a horseradish substitute and the young green pods are a delicacy in India. The leaves are edible and good sources of Vitamins A and C, and protein concentrate. The tree appears in the pharmacopoeia of Africa, Asia, South America and the Caribbean for the traditional treatment of many illnesses including asthma, diarrhea, fever, cough, stomach pains, blood pressure, heart problems, epilepsy and joint diseases (Sajidu et al., 2005).

Moringa oleifera Seed

The seeds of Moringa oleifera can be considered as a lignocellulosic adsorbent due to their cellulose; hemicellulose and lignin constituent. Seeds which contain 30 % and 30 % lipids are made up of functional groups such as O-H, C=O, C-N, macromolecules which comprise (Pagnanelli, Mainelli, Vegliò, & Toro, 2003). Amino acids are a major constituent of the functional groups (Araújo et al., 2010). The proteinases amino acids have diverse structure in relation to pH dependent properties and consist of physiological groupings of varying binding agents. The binding agents have great ability to interact with a metal either by metal ion exchange or complexation to form organo-metallic complex. Moringa oleifera seed (MOS)-metal ion binding appears to be an ion exchange process involving electrostatic attraction between negatively charged groups of amino acids and metallic cations (Kumari et al., 2006).



Fig. 1: Seeds of Moringa oleifera

FACTORS INFLUENCING HEAVY METAL SORPTION OF UNMODIFIED MORINGA OLEIFERA SEEDS IN WASTEWATER TREATMENT

Phenomenon of adsorption is widely used because of its relatively high performance, environmental friendliness and less operational difficulty. A number of researchers have used various adsorbent systems for the removal of heavy metals from waste water, produced from various industrial waste materials. Many of these low-cost sorbents include bark, lignin, farm waste, fly ash and clay minerals (Kalavathy, & Miranda, 2010; Galiatsatou, Metaxas, & Kasselouri-Rigopoulou, 2002). Among the many variables that affect metal adsorption process is pH. pH is the most critical parameter that affecting any adsorption studies (Araújo et al., 2010) due to their interference in the solid–solution interface, effecting the charges of the active sites of the MOS and the metal behavior in the solution (Gao, & Wang, 2007).

Table 2. Heavy metals removal in waste water using unmodified *Moringa Oleifera* seed (LM-Langmuir model, Q_{max}- Adsorption capacity, FM-Freundlich mode NR-Not reported)

Heavy metals	рН	Biomass Dosage (g)	Contact time (min)	Q _{max} (mg g- ¹)	Types of Metal solution	Model	% Removal	Mechanism	Sources
Cd ²⁺	6.5	4.0	40	1.06	Ternar	LM	NR	Amino	(Sharma,
Cr ³⁺	6.5	4.0	40	1.01	y	LM	NR	acid-metal	Kumari,
Ni ²⁺	7.5	4.0	40	0.94	5	LM	NR	interaction	Srivastava, & Srivastava, 2007)
Ag	6.5	2.0	20	NR		NR	100		
Cd^{2+}	6.5	2.0	20	NR		NR	70	Electrostati	(Amoria at al
Co^{2+}	6.5	2.0	20	NR	single	NR	28		(Araújo et al., 2010)
Cu^{2+}	6.5	2.0	20	NR		NR	82	c attraction	2010)
Pb^{2+}	6.5	2.0	20	NR		NR	98		
Cd^{2+}	7	0.4	160	7.864	Single	FM	NR	Ion exchange	(Meneghel et al., 2013)
Cd^{2+}	6.5	4	40	-	Single	NR	85.10		Kumari, et al., 2006
Cd^{2+}	NR	0.5-1.5	60	0.168		LM	NR	Ion	(Madzvamuse,
Cr^{3+}	NR	0.5-1.5	60	-	single	NR	NR		Kugara, Shumba,
Pb^{2+}	NR	0.5-1.5	60	1.281		LM	NR	exchange	2015)
Cd^{2+}	NR	0.2	30	93.30		FM	97	To a	(Aziz,
Pb^{2+}	NR	0.2	30	59.63	single	LM	81	Ion	Jayasuriya, &
Ni ^{2+ d}	NR	0.2	30	101.83		LM	74	exchange	Fan, 2015)
Pb^{2+}	NR	0.2	NR	NR		NR	90	Amino	
Ni ²⁺	NR	0.2	NR	NR		NR	85	acid-metal	(Ali, 2017)
Cd^{2+}	NR	0.2	NR	NR		NR	99	interaction	
Mg^{2+}	4.0- 6.4	0.5	5	5.61	Single	LM	100	Ion exchange	(Marques, Alves, Coelho, & Coelho, 2013)
Cd^{2+}	NR	2	NR	NR		NR	89		(0
Pb^2	NR	2	NR	NR	single	NR	92	Ion	(Sajidu et al.,
Ni ²⁺	NR	2	NR	NR	0	NR	48	exchange	2005)
Cu ²⁺	6.5	2	30	3.83		FM	NR	Amino	(Kowanga,
Pb^{2+}	6.5 5.5	2	30 40	5.85 1.50	single	FM FM	NR	acid-metal	Mauti, & Mbaka,
FU	5.5	Z	40	1.30	-	1.101		interaction	2016)
Cr ³⁺	7	1	60	12.6	single	FM	97.94	Amino	(Ghebremichael,
Cr ⁴⁺	2	1 2	60 60	-	single	NR	97.94 99.9	acid-metal interaction	Gebremedhin, & Amy, 2010)

The next parameter is the dosage or quantities of adsorbing material. Increase in the dosage of adsorbent increases the amount of metal ions adsorbed onto the surface of the adsorbent (Adelaja, Amoo, & Aderibigbe, 2011). The increase is

attributed to the fact that more adsorption sites will be available when the mass of the adsorbent is increased. The period in which the adsorbate and absorbent are in contact with each other influences the efficiency of heavy metal removal. The efficacy is attributed to the rapid uptake of heavy metals onto the surface of the biosorbent in a shorter time followed by slow release of the ions back in the solution with time until an equilibrium is attained. This is due to the saturation of the available adsorption sites present on the MOS (Table 2).

ADSORPTION CAPACITY AND MECHANISM FOR REMOVAL OF HEAVY METAL IONS USING UNMODIFIED MORINGA SEED AS BIOSORBENT

Many studies have reported that metal sequestration occurs through complex mechanisms, including ion-exchange and complexation depending on several factors including biomass dosage, type of metal ion and contact time (Araújo, Melo, Alves, & Coelho, 2010). Seeds of Moringa oleifera have a great sorption capacity for heavy metal removal. The seeds consist of many forms of functional group such as O-H, C=O, C-N, and others physiological diverse group of binding agents. The binding agents consist mainly of negative charges, coming from their surface functional groups, which exchanges with the positive charge of the heavy metal ion through ion-exchange mechanism. Kumari et al. has reported on significant Cd (II) removal from aqueous solution by Moringa oleifera seed (Kumari, et al., 2006). In their study it was shown that the biosorption of Cd by MOS is attributed to the availability of carboxyl groups especially of amino acids functionality interacting with Cd (II) ions to form ligands. According to Kalavathy and Miranda, arsenic, copper, cadmium, lead, nickel and zinc are the most significant contaminants (Kalavathy, & Miranda, 2010). It is well known that the presence of heavy metals in the atmosphere is responsible for a number of diseases associated with the risk of dermal injury, respiratory problems and various forms of cancer, even in moderate concentrations.

The most commonly used isotherm models for adsorption study are Langmuir, Freundlich, Dubinin-Radushkevich and Temkin. It can be clearly observed in Table 2 that metal ions removal has been shown to both fit Langmuir and Freundlich model but majority they are best fitted to Langmuir model (e.g. Cd²⁺, Cr³⁺ and Ni²⁺) which is based on the assumption that adsorption is limited to monolayer coverage, all surface adsorption sites are the same with each site accommodating one adsorbed particle and there is no interaction between neighboring adsorbed molecules or atoms; and there are no phase transition (Ghebremichael et al., 2010). Madzvamuse et al. (2015),compared adsorption properties of MOS and activated MOS as low- cost adsorbent for the uptake of lead, chromium, mercury and Cadmium as mono component system. They found that the data for Moringa oleifera seeds fit well with Langmuir isotherm model for lead and cadmium ion removal. Also, increase in the dosage of Moringa *oleifera* seed from 86.0 % to 99.38 % increases the amount of metal ion adsorbed onto the surface of the adsorbent (Adelaja et al.. 2011: Madzvamuse et al., 2015; Shama et al., 2007). Araújo et al. (2010b) recorded 98% removal of lead using 2.0 grams dosage of Moringa oleifera compared to 81% of lead removal with same dosage of MOS (Aziz et al., 2015), the differences are as a result of the environment in which the experiment were conducted. The mechanism underlying increased sorption of these heavy metals was attributed to in increased amount of adsorption site for greater removal of the heavy metals (Koetlisi and Mucgaonyerwa, 2019).

Moringa oleifera seeds residues have a greater capacity to absorb heavy metals in a single solution compared to multi ion solution. However, in single metal solutions, ions with larger ionic radii are better adsorbed than those with less ionic radii (Igwe and Abia, 2007). Sharma et al., conducted biosorption of multi-solution composed of Cd (II), Cr (III), and Ni (II) on

unmodified shelled Moringa Oleifera seed in ternary mixture and compared it to a single metal ion solution (Sharma et al., 2007). The results of the study suggest that sorption capacity for each of the metal ions present in the multi metal ion solution was less compared to the ions in the single metal solution which was attributed to reduction in the availability of the binding sites (Igberase, Osifo, & Ofomaja, 2017). Also, seeds of plant species like Moringa oleifera (MO) contain natural polyelectrolyte mainly of potential nitrogen and oxygen ligands that are known to have an affinity for coordinating to heavy metals. Sajidu et al., studied the removal of lead, iron and cadmium ions by polyelectrolytes of the Moringa Oleifera whole seed kernel and results indicated that, Moringa Oleifera seed polyelectrolytes showed considerable lead, cadmium and iron removal property with percentage reduction in solutions of 89%, 48% and 92%, respectively (Sajidu et al., 2005).

CONCLUSION

The present articles reviews Moringa Oleifera Seeds as a Low-Cost Biosorbent removing heavy for metals from wastewater. Waterbodies are polluted with heavy metals through various activities, the technologies used various to treat wastewater is very expensive and resource demanding. The seeds of Moringa oleifera has been proved and established as a cost-effective process for the treatment of wastewater. Moringa oleifera seed residue is an inexpensive material that contains amino acid which is a major constituent of the functional groups that aids in heavy metal removal in waste or contaminated water. The binding agents have great ability to interact with the metal either by metal ion exchange or complexation to form organo-metallic complex. Moringa oleifera seed - metal ion binding seems to be an ion exchange mechanism involving electrostatic attraction between negatively charged groups of amino acids and metallic cations. Moringa oleifera seed have the potential to remove heavy metals in single solution than

multi ions solution and is mainly affected by pH "between" 5-8, biosorbent dosage, and contact time.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author's thanks African Center of Excellence in Agroecology and Livelihood System, Faculty of Agriculture, Uganda Martyrs University, Uganda for their financial support and encouragement.

LITERATURE

- Adelaja, O.A., Amoo, I.A., & Aderibigbe, A.D. (2011). Biosorption of Lead (II) ions from aqueous solution using Moringa oleifera pods. Archives of Applied Science Research, 3(6), 50-60.
- Adhiambo, O. R., Lusweti, K. J., & Morang'a, G. Z. (2015). Biosorption of Pb 2 and Cr 2 Using Moringa Oleifera and Their Adsorption Isotherms. Science Journal of Analytical Chemistry, 3(6), 100-108. doi: 10.11648/j.sjac.20150306.14.
- Ali, M.M.A.R. (2017). Improve the efficiency of moringa Seeds extract and used in the removal of heavy elements from groundwater. International Journal of Innovations in Engineering and Technology (IJIET), Special Issue on EGE, 46-50.
- Anwar, F., & Bhanger, M.I. (2003). Analytical characterization of Moringa oleifera seed oil grown in temperate regions of Pakistan. Journal of Agricultural and food Chemistry, 51(22), 6558-6563.
- Anwar, F., Ashraf, M., & Bhanger, M.I. (2005). Interprovenance variation in the composition of Moringa oleifera oilseeds from Pakistan. *Journal of the American Oil Chemists' Society*, 82(1), 45-51.
- Apori, O.S., Hanyabui, E., & Asiamah, Y.J. (2018). Remediation Technology for Copper Contaminated Soil: A Review. Asian Soil Research Journal, 1-7.

- Araújo, C.S., Alves, V.N., Rezende, H.C., Almeida, I.L., de Assunção, R.M., Tarley, C.R., Segatelli, M.G., & Coelho, N.M.M. (2010). Characterization and use of Moringa oleifera seeds as biosorbent for removing metal ions from aqueous effluents. *Water Science* and Technology, 62(9), 2198-2203.
- Araújo, C.S., Melo, E.I., Alves, V.N., & Coelho,N.M. (2010). Moringa oleifera Lam. seeds as a natural solid adsorbent for removal of AgI in aqueous solutions. *Journal of the Brazilian Chemical Society*, 21(9), 1727-1732.
- Aruliah, R., Selvi, A., Theertagiri, J., Ananthaselvam, A., Kumar, K. S., Madhavan, J., & Rahman, P. (2019).
 Integrated remediation processes towards heavy metal removal/recovery from various environments-a review. Frontiers in Environmental Science, 7, 66.
- Aziz, N.A.A., Jayasuriya, N., & Fan, L. (2015). Application of Moringa oleifera'seeds and Musa cavendish'as coagulants for lead, nickel and cadmium removal from drinking water. In Asia Pacific Confederation of Chemical Engineering Congress 2015: APCChE 2015, incorporating CHEMECA 2015 (p. 1774). Engineers Australia.
- Congeevaram, S., Dhanarani, S., Park, J., Dexilin, M., & Thamaraiselvi, K. (2007). Biosorption of chromium and nickel by heavy metal resistant fungal and bacterial isolates. *Journal of hazardous materials*, *146*(1-2), 270-277.
- Coote, C., Stewart, M., & Bonongwe, C. (1997). The distribution, uses and potential for development of Moringa oleifera in Malawi. *The distribution, uses and potential for development of Moringa oleifera in Malawi.*, (67).
- Galiatsatou, P., Metaxas, M., & Kasselouri-Rigopoulou, V. (2002). Adsorption of zinc by activated carbons prepared from solvent extracted olive pulp. *Journal of hazardous materials*, 91(1-3), 187-203.

- Gao, R., & Wang, J. (2007). Effects of pH and temperature on isotherm parameters of chlorophenols biosorption to anaerobic granular sludge. *Journal of hazardous materials*, 145(3), 398-403.
- Ghebremichael, K., Gebremedhin, N., & Amy, G. (2010). Performance of Moringa oliefera as a biosorbent for chromium removal. *Water Science* and Technology, 62(5), 1106-1111.
- Kalavathy, M.H., & Miranda, L.R. (2010). Moringa oleifera—A solid phase extractant for the removal of copper, nickel and zinc from aqueous solutions. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 158(2), 188-199.
- Igberase, E., Osifo, P., & Ofomaja, A. (2017). The adsorption of Pb, Zn, Cu, Ni, and Cd by modified ligand in a single component aqueous solution: equilibrium, kinetic, thermodynamic, and desorption studies. *International journal of analytical chemistry*, 2017.
- Igwe, J.C., & Abia, A.A. (2007). Adsorption isotherm studies of Cd (II), Pb (II) and Zn (II) ions bioremediation from aqueous solution using unmodified and EDTA-modified maize cob. *Eclética Química*, 32(1), 33-42.
- Järup, L. (2003). Hazards of heavy metal contamination. *British medical bulletin*, 68(1), 167-182.
- Da Silva, A.R., & Kerr, W.E. (1999). Moringa: uma nova hortaliça para o Brasil. UFU/DIRIU.
- Kowanga, D.K., Mauti, G.O., & Mbaka, E. (2016). Effect of crude and defatted Moringa oliefera seeds as natural coagulants in the removal of physical, chemical and bacteriological parameters from turbid river water. *Journal of Scientific and Innovative Research*, 5(1), 19-25.
- Koetlisi, K.A., & Muchaonyerwa, P. (2019). Sorption of Selected Heavy Metals with Different Relative Concentrations in Industrial Effluent on Biochar from Human Faecal Products and Pine-Bark. *Materials*, 12(11), 1768.

- Kumari, P., Sharma, P., Srivastava, S., & Srivastava, M.M. (2006). Biosorption studies on shelled Moringa oleifera Lamarck seed powder: removal and recovery of arsenic from aqueous system. *International Journal of Mineral Processing*, 78(3), 131-139.
- Madzvamuse, A., Kugara, J., & Shumba, T. (2015). A Remediation Study Using Moringa oliefera Seed (Uncarbonised and Carbonised) for the Adsorption of Chromium, Cadmium and Lead from Synthetic Water. *International Research Journal of Pure and Applied Chemistry*, 110-121.
- Marques, T.L., Alves, V.N., Coelho, L.M., & Coelho, N.M. (2013). Assessment of the use of Moringa oleifera seeds for removal of manganese ions from aqueous systems. *BioResources*, 8(2), 2738-2751.
- Meneghel, A.P., Gonçalves, A.C., Rubio, F., Dragunski, D.C., Lindino, C.A., & Strey, L. (2013). Biosorption of cadmium from water using Moringa (Moringa oleifera Lam.) seeds. Water, Air, & Soil Pollution, 224(3), 1383.
- Morton, J.F. (1991). The horseradish tree, Moringa pterygosperma (Moringaceae)-a boon to arid lands? *Economic botany*, 45(3), 318-333.
- Mughal, M.H., Ali, G., Srivastava, P.S., & Iqbal, M. (1999). Improvement of drumstick (Moringa pterygosperma Gaertn.)–a unique source of food and medicine through tissue culture. *Hamdard Med*, 42(1), 37-42.
- Muyibi, S.A., Noor, M.J.M.M., Ong, D.T., & Kai, K.W. (2001). Moringa oleifera seeds as a flocculant in waste sludge treatment. *International journal of environmental studies*, 58(2), 185-195.
- Pagnanelli, F., Mainelli, S., Vegliò, F., & Toro, L. (2003). Heavy metal removal by olive pomace: biosorbent characterisation and equilibrium modelling. *Chemical engineering science*, 58(20), 4709-4717.
- Pratt, J.H., Henry, E.M.T., Mbeza, H.F., Mlaka, E., & Satali, L.B. (2002). Malawi agroforestry extension project

marketing & enterprise program, main report. *Malawi Agroforestry*, 47, 139.

- Sajidu, S.M., Henry, E.M.T., Kwamdera, G., & Mataka, L. (2005). Removal of lead, iron and cadmium ions by means of polyelectrolytes of the Moringa oleifera whole seed kernel. WIT Transactions on Ecology and the Environment, 80.
- Sharma, P., Kumari, P., Srivastava, M. M., & Srivastava, S. (2007). Ternary biosorption studies of Cd (II), Cr (III) and Ni (II) on shelled Moringa oleifera seeds. *Bioresource Technology*, 98(2), 474-477.
- Singh, D.B., Rupainwar, D.C., Prasad, G., & Jayaprakas, K.C. (1998). Studies on the Cd (II) removal from water by adsorption. *Journal of Hazardous materials*, 60(1), 29-40.
- Tchounwou, P.B., Yedjou, C.G., Patlolla, A.K., Sutton, D.J., & Luch, A. (2012). Molecular, clinical and environmental toxicology. *Molecular, Clinical and Environmental Toxicology*, 3, 133-164.
- Verbost, P.M., Flik, G., Pang, P.K., Lock, R.A., & Bonga, S.W. (1989). Cadmium inhibition of the erythrocyte Ca2+ pump. A molecular interpretation. *Journal of Biological Chemistry*, 264(10), 5613-5615.