

## **CIVIC EDUCATION POLICIES IN TWO CHINESE SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE REGIONS - A HISTORICAL COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS BETWEEN HONG KONG AND MACAU**

**HUNG CHUNG FUN STEVEN**

Research Scholar, University Hong Kong, Pokfulam, Hong Kong

### **ABSTRACT**

The establishment of the Special Administrative Regions in Hong Kong and Macau represented the new era of Chinese history that, the implementation of “One Country, Two Systems” were really implemented. Civic education signified these policies of the intentions of the authorities conducted. This paper gives these analyses of civic education policy. The study was done through historical, comparative analysis of civic education policy in Hong Kong and Macau, with the context of the two territories after the sovereignty handover and the interim of governance being crucial. These two territories’ comparative study can conclude that, national identity and patriotic education are adopted, but these do not always be implemented effectively. Civic education policies in Hong Kong and Macau are compared and the most effectual reason of policy initiation is the factor aroused historically.

**KEYWORDS:** Civic Education, Comparative Analysis, Governance

### **INTRODUCTION**

At the end of last century, the sovereignties of Hong Kong and Macau were transferred from the colonial government to the government of the People's Republic of China (PRC). Before the sovereignty return, the most daunting part was the armed suppression towards the student democratic movement in some of the big cities like Beijing in the year 1989. The PRC Government, though they did not exert totalitarian, still it had a certain degree of authoritarian. This characteristic can be reflected in both the political systems of the insufficient degree of democracy in the two SAR governments. It also reflects these two special levels of rights protection are built on the basis of less than 20 years' tension of Special Administrative Regions' governance. The society's tension is becoming more apparent, and at a superficial level.

This paper investigates how governing tension appeared in school education, and understands how the government implemented citizenship education, what teaching contents were incorporated in implementing the school's civic education policies, and why it needed to be implemented.

### **CONCEPT OF STUDY: CIVIC EDUCATION**

What is civic education? And, what is civic education policy? It is hard to clearly define. The difficult thing is, applicants already have a self-recognition and understanding of civic education and it does vary from person to person. In the past 100 years, Chinese societies broadly interpret as civic education, but not in a narrow sense of citizenship or citizenship education. This means that, civic education is narrowly interpreted as the understandings of civil right, obligation, democracy and freedom, or is broadly about the exploration of personal, family, social, nation and global social roles. This sequence of curriculum design is called con-centric curriculum concept and perspective. In modern nation

states, civic education should focus more on learners' moral character, traditional conscious recognition and multi-cultural inclusiveness, recognition of the national identity of ethnic status, and patriotism.

Regarding citizenship education in history, it should be Eurocentric: (1) the Enlightenment Citizenship Theory: with personal resistance against the power of Holy's theocracy. (2) Voluntaristic Citizenship Theory: with the democratic system of pluralist competitiveness. Lastly, (3) Emancipatory Citizenship Theory: with the democratic system of active, participatory and critical reflexive practice. Learners should understand civic education matches with the state's political and institutional citizenship. Teaching orientation differs from, (1) transmission approach of citizenship education - it is about the transmission of traditional societal knowledge. (2) Reflective inquiry of citizenship education - it aims to nurture students to make valid and responsive decisions. (3) The critical approach of citizenship education - it is via critical thinking and practice to construct learning and recognition.

### **Historical Transformation and Citizenship Education of Two SARs' Cities, Hong Kong and Macau**

In the modern days, social actions point of abstract principles. Examples like what are citizens' rights and responsibilities; on what basis are social trust being established, how to balance the principle of equality in society, and how to reflect the individualism in society. In its implementation, school, civic education is more or less, preparing and enhancing future citizens whom the country desires. The establishment of two SAR Governments, which are said to be Hong Kong and Macau, raises an issue whether the transfer of sovereignty responses well with the Basic Law illustration of having a high degree of autonomy and the adequate protection of human rights, or they need to follow the China's intention to practice and protect the legitimacy of rule of power and existing sovereignty and other issues.

Britain made Hong Kong become its colony through war. Portugal did not obtain Macau through International Law, but still, it had a certain level of governance. Macau residents had the opportunity to Portugal nationalization. On the other hand, in 1980, Britain recognized problems on sovereignty hence implemented decolonization measures. It did not allow people in Hong Kong to apply for Britain's nationalization. The two SAR governments (Hong Kong and Macau) noticed democratization of the political system. Inside parliamentary politics, they incorporated a limited and incomplete democratic electoral system. However, civil and political rights became an inevitable part in society.

At an early stage, both HK and Macau did not have problems, that could shake the status of government's governance. There was a very small number of persons taking part in collective political actions. It was only the exception of 'Candlelight Vigil for 4 June Massacre in 1989' that, rally headcounts in Hong Kong reached to tens of thousands, while there were few hundred in Macau. There were no more large-scale social movements. Initially, Hong Kong maintained a passionate student movement, but the participating numbers were very small. Since the transfer of sovereignty from Britain to China in July 1997, human rights situation was highlighted. The legislation of the Societies Ordinance and the Public Security Ordinance is linked to citizen's rights, namely the Freedom of Association and Freedom of Expression. This legislation caused big social concerns, with the students' associations expressing strongest opposition.

After the establishment of the Special Administrative Regions, there were no big changes except the regulatory framework. Institutional arrangements focus on the political system. Through elections, the Chief Executive was appointed by the Central government. Such political right exerted limitations on a group of social elites whom were influenced by the Central government. While the public's political rights were limited to a minority of Legislative Council members under

direct election. Hong Kong had formed a 'temporary' Legislative Council; it was so non-democratic compared to the old days. In the first Legislative Council election, only one-third of them were directly elected seats. The case of Macau was even worse - the ratio of directly elected seats was lower. Many seats were appointed and were difficult for the directly-elected members to exert democratic influence. Civil, political rights are restricted in Hong Kong and Macau. The Municipal Councils of Hong Kong and Macau has a long history and functional importance was prohibited after their temporary operations - the real power of parliament in cultural, recreational, environmental, hygienic functions was deliberately eliminated. Power was concentrated in the hands of the non-elected government. The Basic Law of the two SARs focuses on the region's political system arrangements. The Central People's government clearly interfered with the CE's elections.

The democratic camp in Hong Kong got 980,000 votes in the first Legislative Council election, but it dropped to 800,000 in 2000. The Hong Kong government wanted the legislature of the National Security Law in 2002; such created a lot of societal controversies. Most citizens believed that, National Security Law would seriously weaken their civil rights, and endanger social peace and stability. At the end of 2002, both supporters and opponents launched rallies and demonstrations with more than 40,000 participants. But the 1 July demonstrations in 2003, the number of opponents was far from the (government's) imagination that, it turned up to have more than a half million people on the street. This gave pressure to the government and they finally needed to withdraw the draft. With a strong appeal for democracy and political reforms in Hong Kong, it was the power of the masses, that created a civil society. Within the student movements, it emerged to have some active secondary school members. There are two different scenarios on 1 July: (a) every year, more than hundreds of thousands of people goes on street demonstrations, (b) celebration of the return of sovereignty. They are very big contrast.

The number of people and frequency in participating in social movements in Hong Kong were different from Macau. These two territories were incomparable. Not many people in Macau take part in social movements. If they do participate, it will easily be investigated and the participants are subject to punishment. Student participants will also be followed up by the school and adopt corresponding strategies to deal with it. Therefore, it is seen as a taboo in taking part in Macau's social movements. The power of Macau civil society is not strong enough to challenge the governance. One thing that, Macau cannot solve is - the labor problem. The 1997 Asian Financial Crisis badly affected the Macau's economy. The result is that, there was stronger cooperation (between Macau and the Mainland China) enhancing economic take-off, or being referred as economic developments. It did not seem successful; the problem still emerged in 2006. On Labor Day, there were around 5,000 to 10,000 people participating in labor movements. Serious conflicts emerged between the police and the protestors. The Macau government needed to implement measures to ease the social atmosphere. But the labor problems did not stop, emerging one after another. This led to the continuation of social conflicts. When Macau's labor issue is compared with Hong Kong, HK does not have a very big reverberation in society.

**Table 1 Hong Kong and Macau comparison on Rally Headcounts on 1 May (Labor Day), Assembly Headcounts on 1 July (HKSAR Establishment Day) and 4 June (Candlelight Vigil in Memory of the Massacre)**

年份	Hong Kong				Macau		
	June 4	July 1 march	CTU rally	FTU rally	June 4	Dec rally	May 1
1989	150000				20000		
1990	80000-150000						
1991	6000-100000				600		
1992	28000-80000				500		
1993	12000-40000						
1994	12000-40000				800		
1995	16000-35000						
1996	16000-45000						
1997	N.A.-55000	3000					
1998	16000-40000	40					
1999	N.A.-70000	500	300		300-1000		
2000	N.A.-45000	3700	500-600		100-300		
2001	N.A.-48000	350	1000-2000	50	100-200		300
2002	N.A.-45000	429000-502000	500-1000	300	100-200		
2003	N.A.-50000	180000-207000	1000	500	100-150		
2004	48000-82000	200000-240000	1800	1000-1200	100-200		
2005	22000-45000	33000-39000	1000-2000	1400-3000	50-200	80-100	
2006	19000-44000	30000-34000	1500-2500	50	50-200	630*1000	1500-5000
2007	27000-55000	16000-19000	1400-2200	200-500	100-200	1500-7000	2400-10000
2008	18000-48000	32000-37000	2000-2800	1850-3000	70-300	450-1000	700-1000
2009	62800-150000	22000-26000	3500	1500-3000	100-300	950-1100	300-400
2010	113000-150000	22000-26000	1900-3500	1200-2500	400-700	500-1200	800-1000
2011	77000-150000	59000-67000	2300-3100	2500-4000	200-300	200-360	2000-2300
2012	85000-180000	90000-100000	2700-3200	2400-5000	600-800	1100-1300	1400-2000
2013	54000-150000	92000-103000	3700-5000	2600-5000	300-600	150-530	1900-2000
2014	99500-180000	150000-166000	1900-3200	3500-5000	1000-3000	150-270	1000-1400
2015	46600-135000	25000-31000	1400-3400	2600-3500	300-500	480-1800	1800-2000
2016	21800-152000	23000-29000	1100-2500	2200-2900	200		550-1200

Political development in Hong Kong is faster than Macau. This made Macau to treat Hong Kong as a learning target. Since 2003, the two biggest social movements in Hong Kong - 1 July demonstration and the Candlelight Vigil for the 4 June Massacre, the number of participants maintain to be hundred thousand or more. The focus of the said movements was not labour issue; instead, it was a democratic movement. Democracies, freedom, human rights, rule of law, are important core values in a civil society. The student movements in Hong Kong are linked to post-materialism pursuing more lofty values. On the other hand, the Macau government gave cash out to citizens hoping to alleviate the labor problem. The persistent social movements in Hong Kong seem to create changes in Macau too, (the idea of mirroring effect), there were more youngsters' participation, and, the social movements became more diversified. Recently, the 'Occupy Movement', is the most well-known democratic social movement in Hong Kong, But this movement did not successfully reform democratic politics. Instead, it made the activists walk to the extremes, affecting the original political ecology. Before the 'Occupy Movement', Macau also had some marches and demonstrations too - on 25 May 2014 afternoon, 20,000 protestors took on streets in support of the march against the Bill of Greeds and Privileges. In the following two days, 7,000 people surrounded the Assembleia Legislativa (Macau's Legislative Council) and forced the government to withdraw the draft.

## The Educational Situations in Hong Kong and Macau

The paper of this research on civic education policies mainly focuses on primary and secondary universal schooling areas. In the early 1970s, the British government implemented universal schooling and publicized the major schools in Hong Kong. Except around 10% of government schools, mainstream schools were eligible to receive government subsidies. Teaching staff salaries were paid according to the government pointing scales. In the early mainstream educational system, the duration of primary school teaching was 6 years with Cantonese as the medium of instruction. It is followed by 5 years secondary school teaching and 2 years matriculation studies. Both used English as the medium of instruction. After the 1997 return of sovereignty, the government adopted a split in teaching language policies - only 30% of schools maintained English as the medium of instruction in classrooms, while the remaining 70% used Chinese. In 2009, there were education system reforms. The government implemented a four-year university curriculum and a six-year secondary school curriculum. There was also an extension of free education until Secondary 6. But, no matter how the school's systems were changed, there were strict rules in school's curriculum plus a uniformed course outline and an open examination system. The academic qualifications served as entry tickets in helping students to pursue further studies or take part in employment. But civic education, which was advocated in 1985, was not included in the compulsory curriculum and not a publicly examined subject. Every academic subject, like Liberal Studies, can only add little and little elements of civic education in it.

The Macau government never stressed about education at all. There was a small number of government schools teaching Portuguese and using this as the criteria in choosing civil servants. Apart from this, most of the schools were private schools. There were no universities in Macau. It was until the sovereignty problem emerged that, the Macau government, under strong demands from the public, started to show more concern to education and agreed to put more resources in it. Therefore, there was no unified teaching environment in Macau's educational system. For the primary and secondary schools' systems, there were various operating models. Most of these models were with reference to education of Portugal, Taiwan or Hong Kong. The teaching language was split out, which was being referred as tri-literacy and quadra-lingual. There were schools using Chinese, Portuguese and English as the medium of instructions. The teaching curriculum design was also much diversified too. At the completion stage of universal education, there is an absence of a unified public examination. School Sponsoring Bodies employed teachers in a private form, this meant that, they offered no unified remuneration and the teachers could be of different qualification standards. There was no age limit for retirement and no set requirement on the class size in every form. After the implementation of the Education Law in 1991, better-managed schools were continuously built and they followed educational regulations. Finally, Macau surpassed Hong Kong in incorporating civic education into school's curriculum. But up to now, Hong Kong has not successfully done this arrangement.

## METHOD OF STUDY

This paper uses historical comparative method investigating the school's civic education policies in Hong Kong and Macau. It aims to project the government measures on civic education policies in an historical context, and provide comparisons. There are similarities between Hong Kong and Macau. First, both of them used to be colonies and some colonial history can be found. Second, their sovereignties were returned to Mainland China. The establishments of 'HKSAR' and 'Macau SAR', are done under Chinese constitution. While they do differ in the educational systems, the

curriculum and school managements. Through different regime transitions, Hong Kong has a common-law system while Macau has a civil law system. There are basic differences in the economic, socio-cultural changes and developments in these places. This comparative analysis can highlight the similarities and differences in its nature and contents, hence strengthening reader's understanding on school's civic education policies.

### **Contents of Study**

This paper starts from a historical context of development and change, then provide comparisons and analysis. It aims to help readers understand how school's civic education policies are implemented. In this part, the policies are analyzed according to the characteristics and features of selected historical periods.

### **Civic Education Documents in Hong Kong and Macau before the Transfer of Sovereignty**

In 1991, Macau's Education Law stated it would enhance and strengthen moral and civic education. In 1994, it established a curriculum framework through regulations, followed by the launch of moral education ethics and civic education courses in primary and secondary schools respectively. With Macau's specific conditions, it enhanced the transmission of culture and development of citizenship, meaning hoping to nurture citizens who are free, autonomous, responsible, cooperative, society-caring and possess critical spirits. These teaching contents can be incorporated into the moral, civic, or religious educational areas. The problem of civic education in Hong Kong emerged as early as year 1985 after the finalization of Hong Kong's future problems and, during the implementation of representative government.

Before the transfer of sovereignty, two separate documents were used in exploring the civic education issues. They illustrated the civic education policies after the colonial government adopted the decolonization policy, so that, the civic education in SARs schools became more meaningful. Civic education guidelines in Hong Kong schools were more student-oriented. Once students grew up, they became a citizen with the right value, attitude and belief. At a higher rank, they achieve self-actualization and public goodness. Also, they can have the ability to put citizens' values into practice, for example, they possess thinking skills of criticality and creativity. The whole course comprises of seven parts, namely: knowledge, reflection, action, value, attitude, faith and ability.

Macau's civic education advocated citizenship ideas like democracy, community, equality, cross-culture and environmental-awareness. To achieve this dream, it was necessary to have perfect communitarianism. Cities should be based on equality. No doubt, the way that, Hong Kong and Macau advocated civic education was different from that, in previous colonial rule. They adopt a different response hoping to facilitate the take-over of future communist regime.

### **Early School Civic Education Policies after the Successful Transfer of Sovereignty**

Later, the transfer of sovereignty happened in Hong Kong and Macau. Civic education was not a part of the school's curriculum and it was also not a compulsory examination subject. But the two SAR governments seemed to be passionate in implementing civic education policies in schools. When the Hong Kong's regime was just handed over back to China, the government made a breakthrough and requested schools to develop civic education courses at junior secondary school level. Schools should adopt a student-based approach. It hoped to nurture students to have conversational, reasoning, decision-making, and critical-thinking abilities. Also they encouraged students to apply what they have learnt to their daily life. But unfortunately, these policies were overlooked and ignored by the government. Later, the Secretary for Education and Manpower, Fanny LAW Fan Chiu-Fun, and, chairman of Education Commission, Antony

LEUNG Kam-Chung, decided to scrap the civic education policies and started all over again.

On 8 July 2000, Macau organized a seminar on curriculum reform. During that period of time, the Secretary for Social and Cultural Affairs Fernando CHUI Sai-On pointed out that, Macau had always been lacking humanities and civic education courses. He added that, Macau could take Hong Kong as reference, in implementing courses on: 'One Country, Two Systems', 'and Macau people administering Macau 'and' High degree of autonomy'. Same year in November, discs relating to national flag, national emblem, regional flag, regional emblem were released. These served as supplementary teaching resources for primary school and the junior secondary level students. Schools also organized activities to increase peoples' awareness towards Chinese culture. They provided civic education to the general public. But the teaching contents were just at the superficial level and did not have high knowledge value. Also, it did not seem to be meaningful under the utilitarian educational examination system. Next year in January, the Chief Executive of Macau Edmund HO Hau-Wah, announced in his policy address that, he would further develop civic education, aiming to increase students' understanding on state concepts, national consciousness, the Basic Law, and 'One Country, Two Systems'. Generally, Macau citizens are passive in accepting state's policies, unlike people in Hong Kong - they like to actively express opposition.

Among of many proposals of education reforms, year 2000 Hong Kong 'Learning to Learn: The Way Forward in Curriculum Development Consultation Paper' stated that, moral and civic education should come as the first priority. In short term, they can increase students' recognition of their national identity (which is Chinese) and strengthen their social and state's responsibilities. Year 2001 'Learning to Learn' curriculum paper mentioned five priority values. Within these, moral and civic education included "Perseverance, Respect for Others, responsibility, National Identity and Commitment". Year 2002 'Curriculum Guide' stated moral and civic education was one of four major concerns. The government's direction was civic education stressing about national identity and culture recognition, aiming to push down democracy and human rights issues. But many educational reforms and policies could not be immediately implemented. Therefore, the government faced with legitimacy crisis. In April 2002, Macau's Education and Youth Affairs Bureau and Legal Affairs Bureau complied Macau's Basic Law teaching kit. These resources related to students' life hoping they could find it easy to understand. Actually, the HK government also took similar things forward. But this was not compulsory for schools to implement. Schools in Hong Kong and Macau were given freedom to decide whether they would carry it out or not.

### **Correspondence to the Civil Society Movement**

The development of civic education remained stagnant. In the 1st session of the 10th National People's Congress, three Macau representatives jointly submitted a proposal urging China to adopt effective measures to strengthen Macau citizen's quality of education, to put more focus helping them develop moral values and views on life. The Macau government responded in an optimistic way, and compulsorily requested all primary schools to include subjects in areas of Character Education. Schools should stress much on civic education.

Macau strengthened patriotism education after its transfer of sovereignty to Mainland China. It provided civic education to children and teenagers, inheriting the good Chinese culture tradition and carrying forward contemporary teenagers' pioneering spirits. It also made the good use of schools' and society's learning resources. For example, it developed 'Loving China Loving Macau' education plan. Year 2007 'Outline Act of Non-Higher Educational System in Macau' stated, cultivating and enhancing students' patriotism to 'love China love Macau' was the first priority task among the other four non-higher education overall goals. The Macau government attached great importance in cultivating students

the right awareness and feelings when they were young.

In 2003, an unprecedented large-scale social movement occurred in Hong Kong because of government's enactment of the National Security Law. On 1 July, the day which people should be celebrating its 6th anniversary of its sovereignty return, 500,000 people went on street demonstrations in strongly expressing their dissatisfactions towards the government's said policies. That was the formation of the new civil society movement. In the coming few years, Macau's protests and marches became more radicalized. There was a continuous increase in the number of protesters, followed by increased conflicts too. At that period of time, Macau sped up its economic growth. With the further opening of the gambling right, gambling industry was well-positioned in leading Macau's economic developments. Promoting gambling industry has a negative effect on teenagers' moral values. But the government did not stop promoting gambling because they believed moral education can make up the deficiencies. While the government set out moral and civic education's academic performances, they incorporated contents like 'understanding of the lottery tourism industry' and 'attitude towards money' into related courses. In 2007, the government published a set of teaching materials like 'Respect for life', 'Draw the boundary, understand gambling' aiming to cultivate teenagers' positive values and responsibilities, increase their recognition and resistance ability on the negative effects of gambling. At the same time, they decided to treat 'moral and civic education' as a compulsory course from primary school level to senior secondary school level. Also, they adopted standardization measures on legal education, fostering students' awareness and ability to proactively obey the law, social rules and public order.

In 2005, TUNG Chee-hwa stepped down from his position of Chief Executive in Hong Kong, and was replaced by Donald TSANG Yam-Kuen. That provided a completely new look on SAR governance. Although he did not obtain a chance for the passage of his constitutional reform package at the end of 2005, the public opinion survey showed that, his policies were supported by a majority of citizens. At a later stage, though marches and protests continued, the number of participants reduced significantly. Such reduced pressure on SAR government administration. At the same time, HK had educational system reforms. There is a big change on the secondary, matriculation, and university school systems. 5-year secondary school education, 2-year matriculation study, 3-year university education were changed to 6-year secondary and 4-year university corresponding to the school systems in China, Taiwan and Macau.

The 'Character and Citizens' teaching materials were published in accordance with Macau's social environment basing on primary school students' growth and psychological developments as principles. The theme setting, reflected character and citizens' education modernity, completeness, and liveliness.

Year 2009, waves of governance conflicts emerged in Hong Kong and Macau. After the Beijing Olympics, LIU Xiao-Bo was sentenced again and was awarded the Nobel Peace Prize. This aroused public concern. The recognition of national identity started to become worse - more youngsters rejected to admit they are Chinese. That prompted Macau to launch a consultation of 'New curriculum framework of secondary students' Character and Citizens' in year 2010. This new formal curriculum framework required to increase students' physical and psychological well-being, cultivated their cooperative and critical-thinking abilities at the junior secondary school level. While at the senior secondary school level, it stressed about career planning and the increased awareness of citizenship. The ways and means of curriculum assessment were mainly through school's internal assessments, comprehensive assessments, and special or professional assessments. This changed the traditional method of conducting assessments via religious education path, illustrating this subject did not

meet the complete requirements of character and citizens' education.

The Hong Kong government faced with a change of the national identity as more and more people rejected to admit they were Chinese. They then decided to treat national education as a compulsory subject at schools creating great disturbances in society. In 2010 policy address, the Chief Executive, Donald TSANG suggested the development of moral and national curriculum. Consequently, the 'Committee on the Initiation of Moral and National Education Subject' was formed. Year 2011 he launched some consultations and still denying treating national education as a compulsory subject. But later, he did not keep his own words. The aim of this curriculum was to nurture students' positive values and attitudes, and to cultivate a good character and citizen's quality. But the practical implementation problem was how to establish the national identity. It was stereotyped by the public, 'it was brainwashing education'. In 2011, a 15-year-old boy Joshua WONG organized protests opposing such brainwashing education, but the number of participants was only 300 (very small). A year after, each school was additionally subsidized HK\$530,000 in promoting moral and national education. The number of protestors coming on streets then reached to 120,000. Apart from it, the consecutive 10-day 'Occupy Government Headquarters' Movement' led by Joshua WONG prompted a total of 90,000 protestors on streets during peak periods. Because of that, the government finally needed to shelve the plan. This provoked more intense civil society movements in Hong Kong and Macau, illustrating that, patriotism education did not exert positive effects at schools. On the internet, there was a face-book homepage titled 'Macau students alliance against crab and brainwashing civic education!' There were also some opposing sounds on national education implementation in Macau.

### **Implementation of School Civic Education under Authoritarian Politics**

Teenagers have a low recognition of their national identity. The government then devised more plans on implementing national education. Major activities included promoting exchanges to Mainland China and organizing national education courses.

Recently, various (industry) sectors organize patriotic educational activities; most of them were national symposium or arrange teenagers to China in the form of visits, exchanges, networking. The aim was to increase their understanding towards China hence patriotism through information dissemination and personal experience. If the government was steamrolling and spoon-feeding the implementation of patriotism education, it just lets young people feel it is a mental burden.

In order to cope with the 'System Framework for Private School Teaching Staff of Non-tertiary Education' implementation, every private school management was busy with the financial and teachers' budget planning for each academic year. On the issue of hiring new teachers, it was uneasy to find professionals teaching Character and Citizens subject.

While schools agreed that, education should include the development of students' character and the cultivation of civic responsibility, whether they could provide appropriate learning resources for character and citizen's subject was a matter of concern. Macau did not note about this in the policy implementation. In the 10/2015 administration regulation 'The Requirements of Basic Academic Attainments of Local Education System' was officially promulgated, so that Macau's educational development was moving in a more standardized direction.

Many field visits and mainland exchanges were just conducted in a formal way; practically they did not offer a

chance to deeply understand the national situations and historical problems. Recently, some human rights problems like 'LIU Xiao-Bo is sent to prison', industrial disasters like Tianjin explosion, Chinese leader BO Xi-Lai's corruption case, these are all serious and important issues. They destructed our country's image and should not be ignored. They were related to the national performance behavior, and were the major reasons explaining why there was a change on the recognition of national identity in Hong Kong and Macau.

Recently, the biggest social movements in Hong Kong and Macau directed at the government authority. When faced with the constitutional reform package in Hong Kong, it came with the emergence of the 'Occupy Central movement'. But this was different from other previous social movements in the sense that, it gave prediction 'there was possibly a mass movement being organized'. Of course, that triggered a heated debate in society. One of the controversies was that, whether it was righteous to talk about Occupy Movement in schools. Schools stated they would not prohibit teachers from bringing this in class as academic discussion topic; this was especially for the Liberal Studies lessons. Whether teenagers should take part in such civil disobedience movement fighting for democracy was also very controversial in society too, that prompted Macau to organize a large-scale social movement. In May 2014, because of the need to pass the bill, 'Welfare Package for Designated, Incumbent and Former Chief Executives and Principal Officials', 20,000 people marched on streets with 7,000 protesters surrounding and occupying Macau's Legislative Council. It was mostly teenagers who initiated and participated in this protest. The government was then under pressure to withdraw the bill. This social movement was an important signal in Macau's civil movements. It also gave a forecast to Hong Kong, it would appear to have Occupy Movements which were more intense, of bigger form, and of bigger scale.

With a decision made by the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress, Hong Kong's future election of the Chief Executive will be conducted in a selective and non-democratic way. It is never done via universal suffrage. In September 2014, some student movements instructed people to occupy Central. That created conflicts between the Police force and the public, the police needed to use tear gas to disperse the crowd. This had a very big rebound effect - more than 10,000 protesters occupying the major transport routes in main districts in Hong Kong and Kowloon, more than 200 secondary schools went on strike. Finally, this occupy movement lasted for 79 days. Because of this Occupy Movement in HK, the Chinese Association of Hong Kong & Macao Studies (CAHKMS) convened a meeting in January 2015 featuring Hong Kong teenagers' problems. It planned to increase their recognition of national identity. The only method is to put more focus on national education at schools. At that period of time, public opinion survey showed that, teenagers' recognition of their national identity in both Hong Kong and Macau reached historically very low.

Hong Kong's Occupy Movement can help us understand that, the government failed to educate the future generations successfully. The deepest reflection is why they do not understand teenagers, and, the essence of youth work. For every educational policy, they just think from a one-sided angle in protecting the state's regime. These are being implemented in Hong Kong and Macau, and unfortunately, have not yielded any effective results so far.

## **DISCUSSIONS AND CONCLUSIONS**

Hong Kong and Macau terminated British's and Portuguese's governance in year 1997 and 1999 respectively. Their SARs (HKSAR and Macau SAR) are established in accordance with Article 31 of the Constitution of the People's Republic of China. Both the British and Portuguese governments underwent de-colonization process before they returned their sovereignties back to China. To some extents, they provided some empowerments to the general public. After the

successful sovereignties return, policies in Hong Kong and Macau are implemented with reference to the Basic Law. Regarding the implementation of educational policies, they need to promote civic education. Apart from teaching students' civic responsibility and compulsory education, it is also necessary to teach them the recognition of national identity and promote patriotism education. On the job implementation, Macau seems to have a better mastery at a superficial level, while students in Hong Kong have an extremely strong response - they created a large-scale social movement before. In responding to the authoritarian school's educational policies, students in HK and Macau organized vigorous social movements in showing their resistance. There are differences between the two places - recently, students in Macau become silent, while there are some re-structuring in student movements in Hong Kong, they are waiting for a good chance and may organize another movement later.

Regarding school's implementation of civic education in Hong Kong and Macau, it shows the importance of post-colonial governance in re-gaining its national sovereign education. The two places stress much on civic education aiming to increase students' recognition of national identity. But, their political systems do not devise a set of parliamentary politics with a sufficient degree of democracy; the government also seems to be ineffective in promoting civic education especially in areas of democracy and human rights education. Instead, they adopt a 'Chinese-style' democracy in dominating the educational system contents; they claim to treat 'nationalist patriotism' as the primary educational policy to be implemented. But they do not state clearly how to reasonably, and effectively, implement patriotism education. If this is clearly done, this will not have any negative effects in school's education.

Regarding school's implementation of civic education in Hong Kong and Macau, it shows the importance of post-colonial governance in re-gaining its national sovereign education. (The two places stress much on civic education) aiming to increase students' recognition of national identity. But, their political systems do not devise a set of parliamentary politics with a sufficient degree of democracy; the government also seems to be ineffective in promoting civic education especially in areas of democracy and human rights education. Instead, they adopt a 'Chinese-style' democracy in dominating the educational system contents; they claim to treat 'nationalist patriotism' as the primary educational policy to be implemented. But they do not state clearly how to reasonably, and effectively, implement patriotism education. (If this is clearly done, this will not have any negative effects in school's education).

## REFERENCES

1. Chan, Chi-hou (2004). Moral and civic education – the hidden curriculum in Macau, *Journal of Moral Education*, Vol. 33, No. 4, December 2004, pp. 553-573.
2. Curriculum Development Council (2000). *Learning To Learn (Consultation Document)*. Hong Kong: Curriculum Development, HKSAR, the PRC.
3. Curriculum Development Council (2001). *Learning to Learn - The Way Forward in Curriculum*. June 2001. Hong Kong: Curriculum Development, HKSAR, the PRC.
4. Curriculum Development Council (2002). *Basic Education Curriculum Guide – Building on Strengths (P1 – S3)*. Hong Kong: Curriculum Development, HKSAR, the PRC.
5. Government of the Macao Special Administrative Region. (2006). “Law of Bases of the Non-Higher Education System”, Administrative Regulations No. 9/2006. Macau: Government of the Macao Special Administrative

Region. <http://images.io.gov.mo/bo/i/2006/52/lei-9-2006.pdf>

6. Government of the Macao Special Administrative Region. (2014). "Curriculum Framework for Formal Education of Local Education System", Administrative Regulations No. 15/2014. Macau: Government of the Macao Special Administrative Region. [http://bo.io.gov.mo/bo/i/2014/26/regadm15\\_cn.asp](http://bo.io.gov.mo/bo/i/2014/26/regadm15_cn.asp)
7. Vong, S. K. (2007). Discourses and practices of moral and civic education curriculum in secondary schools in the context of Macau (book chapter). In Grossman, L & T. Y. Lo (Eds.), *Social Education in the Asia-Pacific: Critical Issues and Multiple Perspectives* (pp.137 – 163), US: Information Age Publishing
8. Vong, S. K. (2016). "Harmonizing a melody?! – A critical study of moral and civic education policy of the non-tertiary education system in Macao", *Asian Education and Development Studies*, Vol. 5 Iss 1 pp. 71 – 93.