

SMALL-SIDED GAMES VERSUS INTERVAL TRAINING IN ADOLESCENT SOCCER PLAYERS: EFFECTS ON SPEED, CHANGE OF DIRECTION SPEED AND JUMPING PERFORMANCE

¹Faculty of sport and physical education, University of Niš, Serbia;

²Faculty of sport and physical education, University of Novi Sad, Serbia;

³Faculty of Economics, University of Novi Sad, Serbia

Original research

Abstract

The aim of this research was to determine the effects of small-sided games and interval training on vertical jump, speed and change of direction speed in adolescent soccer players. A total of 60 young male soccer players (aged 14–18 years) were recruited. Players were assigned to small-sided group (SSG), or high intensity interval group (HIT) during the last 8 weeks of the season. Physical performance tests included a squat jump (SJ), countermovement jump (CMJ) countermovement jump with arm movement (CMJAM), 5-m, 10-m and 20-m sprints and illinois test. HIT was performed over 40-m shuttles, with 15s-15s, intermittent runs. And for the SSG programme a team size of 3 or 4 players was used on different pitch size. Both groups improved in the 5-m sprint ($p < 0.05$). There was a significantly greater improvement in the 20-m sprint ($p < 0.05$, large effect), Illinois ($p < 0.05$, large effect), SJ ($p < 0.05$, moderate effect), and CMJ ($p < 0.05$, large effect) following the HIT training compared with the SSG. To conclude, during the last weeks of the season, HIT training improved or maintained fitness status in adolescent soccer players. On contrary, SSG training seems to only maintain or even decrease the physical performance in the end of the season among adolescent soccer players.

Key words: change of direction, power, sprint, team sport

Introduction

During one soccer match, elite adolescent soccer players often cover distances greater than six kilometers during which an intermittent activity has the most important roll for performance and success (Buchheit, Mendez-Villanueva, Simpson, & Bourdon, 2010). Analyses in soccer revealed the intermittent nature of the game, and consequently, HIT was used to simulate the demands of a match-play (Dellal, Owen, Wong, Krustup, van Exsel, & Mallo 2012; Iaia, Rampinini, and Bangsbo, 2009; Orendurff et al, 2004). High-intensity intermittent training (HIT) and Small-sided games (SSG) are very popular and effective form of exercise with small time requirement. It was stated that HIT training can improve not only maximal aerobic performance and VO₂max (Wong, Chaouachi, Chamari, Dellal, & Wisloff, 2010)

but also solicit anaerobic metabolism (Dellal, Keller, Carling, Chaouachi, Wong, & Chamari, 2010). One paper found similar results for HIT and traditional aerobic conditioning for improving VO₂max in female collegiate soccer players (Rowan, Kueffner, & Stavrianeas, 2012). More recently, Howard, & Stavrianeas (2017) found in high school soccer players that both, the endurance training group and the high-intensity interval training group showed significant improvements in Yo-Yo intermittent recovery test level 1. In one study, conducted on 14-year-old soccer players peak VO₂ increased significantly following 5 weeks of HIT compared 5 weeks of high-volume training (Sperlich et al, 2011). In contrast, small-sided games have been used for years in soccer. Nevertheless, SSG were only recently been the focus of scientific research because of the effects on

physical capacity while the technical and tactical parameters remain on the same level (Dellal et al, 2012). Moreover, coaches and players generally prefer the use of SSGs (Dellal, Lago-Penas, & Chamari, 2011). However, there are several variables that could influence the intensity of SSGs. These include rules, pitch size (Tessitore, Meeusen, Piacentini, Demarie, & Capranica, 2006), the presence of goalkeepers (Mallo, & Navarro, 2008), the number of players (Hill-Haas, Coutts, Dawson, & Rowsell, 2010), duration of the exercise (Jones, & Drust, 2007), the availability of replacement soccer balls (Rampinini, et al., 2007). Moreover, the SSGs elicit different physical and technical activities in amateur and professional soccer players (Dellal, et al., 2011). Additionally, SSGs might not be an ideal solution for all playing standards and levels because Dellal et al. (2012) revealed that the physiological responses to SSG were skill depended.

Table 1 Mean \pm SD results of different body composition parameters before and after 8-week of HIT and SSG training

	HIT group		SSG group	
	Baseline	Final	Baseline	Final
Age	15.5 \pm 0.46	15.7 \pm 0.46	15.7 \pm 0.67	15.9 \pm 0.67
Height	180.57 \pm 6.6	180.77 \pm 6.5	176.29 \pm 6.1	176.49 \pm 6.2
Body mass	71.89 \pm 9.12	72.72 \pm 8.73*	63.41 \pm 9.71	64.45 \pm 8.61*
Body fat	8.02 \pm 1.82	7.44 \pm 1.22*	6.75 \pm 4.85	7.49 \pm 3.55
Body fat %	11.20 \pm 2.02	10.96 \pm 2.92	10.25 \pm 4.97	11.44 \pm 3.99*
BMI	21.98 \pm 1.89	22.23 \pm 1.79	20.35 \pm 2.52	20.72 \pm 2.11
Muscle mass	36.42 \pm 5.02	37.01 \pm 4.99*	31.93 \pm 4.11	32.08 \pm 4.16

Data are presented as Mean \pm SD

* Significantly different from baseline, $p < 0.05$

Although the effects of SSGs versus HIT have been already compared in elite soccer players (Impellizzeri et al., 2006), according to authors knowledge studies that aim to compare the effects of SSG and HIT on physical performance in adolescent soccer players are limited. Moreover, the comparison of effects on speed and vertical jump has not been carried out, especially during

the last weeks of the season in adolescent soccer players. Therefore, the aim of this research was to determine the effects of SSG and HIT on vertical jump, speed and change of direction speed in adolescent soccer players.

Methods

Participants

A total of 60 young male soccer players (aged 14–18 years) were recruited. Written informed consent was obtained from the players and their parents. All participants were from a professional soccer club and completed on average 10 h of combined soccer training and competitive play per week. The experimental protocol received approval from the institutional ethics committee from the Faculty of Sport and Physical Education, University of Novi Sad.

Procedures

Players' anthropometric characteristics and components of fitness were measured in the morning, at least 12 h fasted and 24 h from the last high-intensity exercise effort. Measurements were taken in the late April with final measurement in June. All study procedures took place at a football club outdoor facility. The same instructors tested the same participants and the fitness tests were performed in the same order with identical equipment, positioning, and technique. All participants took part in one introductory session during which time proper form and technique on each fitness test were reviewed and practiced. During this session assistants demonstrated proper testing procedures and participants practiced each test. After the training program, the players were instructed to perform the tests in the same order as they did before the training program. Participants were asked not to perform any vigorous physical activity the day before or the day of any study procedure. Basic anthropometric characteristics (Body weight and Body height) were measured, in accordance with the IBP program, on the day of the testing. Before each testing, the participants performed a standard 20-minute warm-up. Standard warm up protocol consisted of 10 min of warm up running and 10 min of dynamic stretching and 5 x 30m of running exercises.

Fitness of players was estimated by the following tests: Squat and countermovement jumps (with and without arm movement); SJ CMJ and the CMJAM were determined using a force platform (Quattro Jump, version 1.04, Kistler Instrument AG, Winterthur, Switzerland) at a sampling rate of 500 Hz. Jump height

was determined as the center of mass displacement, calculated from the recorded force and body mass. Subjects began the SJ at a knee angle of 90, avoiding any downward movement, and they performed a vertical jump by pushing upward, keeping their legs straight throughout. The position of the feet was standardized during all tests at shoulder width. The CMJ was begun from an upright position, making a downward movement to a knee angle of 90 and simultaneously beginning to push-off. One minute of rest was allowed between 3 trials of each test, the largest jump being used in subsequent analyses.

Acceleration and maximum running speed. The running speed of players was determined using a 20-m sprint effort with photocell gates (Microgate, Polifemo Radio Light, Italy) placed 0.4 m above the ground, with an accuracy of 0.001 ms. The timer was automatically activated as participants crossed the first gate at the starting line with split times at 5 m, and 10 m. Players were instructed to run as quickly as possible over the 20-m distance from a standing start (crouched start positioned 0.5 m behind the timing lights). Acceleration was evaluated using the time to cover the first 5 m of the 20-m test. Participants performed two trials with at least 3 min of rest between them. The best performance of the two tests was used for analysis.

Illinois agility test: The length of the field is 10m, while the width (distance between the start and finish points) is 5m. Four cones were placed in the center of the testing area at a distance of 3.3m from one another. Four cones were used to mark the start, finish and two turning points. The subjects started the test lying face down, with their hands at shoulder level. The trial started on the “go” command, and the subjects began to run as fast as possible. The trial was completed when the players crossed the finish line without having knocked any cones over. Three trials were performed by every subject with the best score used for analysis.

Training Program

Players were assigned to SSG, or HIT group during the last 8 weeks of the season. In addition to the SSG and HIT programs, all players continued to participate in their usual training (technical and tactical) sessions and official games. It was ensured that all the players received the same training routines, except for the HIT and SSG parts. Heart rate responses were monitored during the HIT and SSG training sessions to provide the mean HR percentage (%HRmean) and the percentage of maximal HR (%HRmax) reached during training sessions. The maximum HR was determined as the peak HR observed during the IFT30-15.

Hit Training

High-intensity interval training was performed over 40-m shuttles, with 15s-15s, intermittent runs (Table 2). The individual intensity of the runs was selected according to the players' V30-15IFT as previously shown (Buchheit, 2008).

Table 2 HIT Training Program

Week	Protocol	VIFT Based Intensity
1	3 sets (5 reps of 15"-15" HIT)	90% VIFT
2	3 sets (5 reps of 15"-15" HIT)	90% VIFT
3	3 sets (8 reps of 15"-15" HIT)	90% VIFT
4	3 sets (8 reps of 15"-15" HIT)	90% VIFT
5	4 sets (6 reps of 15"-15" HIT)	95% VIFT
6	4 sets (8 reps of 15"-15" HIT)	95% VIFT
7	4 sets (6 reps of 15"-15" HIT)	95% VIFT
8	4 sets (6 reps of 15"-15" HIT)	95% VIFT

VIFT- speed of the final phase completed in full

Small-Sided Games

The content of the SSG programme was inspired and modified from several protocols. We have used a team size of 3 or 4 players on each team because it elicits the best responses, both physiologically and in terms of skill development (Jeffreys, 2004). The exercise program was performed during 8 weeks. The sessions were performed in 4×4 and 3x3 method in a 20×15m, 25x18 field. The protocol included several rule changes in order to increase the intensity of play. Maximum of two touches were allowed during first ten minutes. Moreover, each time the ball goes out of play, the coach immediately fed in another ball resulting in a constant flow to the play and thus avoiding any notable decrease on the physical demands of the player. These exercises were done twice a week.

Statistical Analysis

Data were tested for normality with a Shapiro-Wilk normality test. Because data were normally distributed, the variables were analyzed using a 2-way repeated measures analysis of variance with training group (2 levels: SSG group and HIT group) and time effect (before and after training) as factors. When a significant interaction was noted, Bonferroni post hoc test was conducted. Differences were considered significant at $p \leq 0.05$. The ESs of ,0.09, 0.10–0.49, 0.50–0.79, and .0.80 were considered trivial, small, moderate, and large, respectively (Cohen, 2013). Statistical analyses were processed using SPSS Statistics (SPSS Inc., Chicago, IL, USA, version. 16.0).

Results

The %HRmean during the training sessions in the SSGs training group ranged between $88.6 \pm 1.4\%$ and $92.1 \pm 1.1\%$ HRmax, which was not significantly different ($p > 0.05$) than the corresponding HIT group values ($90.4 \pm 1.1\%$ and $93.5 \pm 0.9\%$ HRmax). The %HRmax reached during SSGs was $93.3 \pm 1.3\%$, similar to that recorded by HIT group ($94.2 \pm 1.5\%$). There were no significant baseline fitness differences between the groups ($p > 0.05$).

Table 3 Mean \pm SD results of different fitness parameters before and after 8-week of HIT and SSG training

	HIT group		SSG group	
	Baseline	Final	Baseline	Final
SJ	39.17 \pm 4.51	42.01 \pm 4.14*	41.44 \pm 4.77	41.69 \pm 4.28
CMJ	39.81 \pm 4.82	46.45 \pm 6.54*	41.58 \pm 4.77	42.64 \pm 4.34
CMJAM	49.01 \pm 5.05	50.16 \pm 5.09	51.68 \pm 4.62	51.52 \pm 4.10
SP5	1.15 \pm 0.05	1.12 \pm 0.03*	1.12 \pm 0.09	1.08 \pm 0.09*
SP10	1.94 \pm 0.13	1.92 \pm 0.05	1.86 \pm 0.11	1.84 \pm 0.11
SP20	3.36 \pm 0.21	3.22 \pm 0.11*	3.27 \pm 0.18	3.23 \pm 0.14
Illinois	15.68 \pm 0.51	14.85 \pm 0.35*	14.92 \pm 0.37	15.12 \pm 0.55

Data are presented as Mean \pm SD;

* Significantly different from baseline, $p < 0.05$;

SJ- squat jump; CMJ- countermovement jump;

CMJAM- countermovement jump with arm movement;

SP5- 5m sprint; SP10- 10sprint; SP20- 20m sprint.

There was a significant improvement in the 5-m sprint following training in both groups ($p < 0.05$, small to moderate effects). There was a significantly greater improvement in the 20-m sprint ($p < 0.05$, large effect), Illinois ($p < 0.05$, large effect), SJ ($p < 0.05$, moderate effect), and CMJ ($p < 0.05$, large effect) following the HIT training compared with the SSG. No significant within- or between group differences were found in CMJAM, and SP10 following training ($p > 0.05$, trivial effect).

Discussion

The aim of this study was to examine the effects of SSG and HIT on vertical jump, speed and change of direction speed in adolescent soccer players. The main finding of our study was that HIT training was more effective than SSG in maintaining or improving speed, COD and vertical jump in adolescent soccer players during the last weeks of the season.

We expected similar effects of both training methods having in mind similar high cardiorespiratory responses (Dellal et al, 2008). However, because the HIT program was performed at a running intensity slightly higher than that of the SSGs, and because in HIT, COD is consistently required at high speed (Dellal et al, 2012), the HIT showed greater improvements in COD when compared with the SSG.

Speed is considered to be an important aspect of soccer players' performance (Radziminski, Rompa, Barnat, Dargiewicz, & Jastrzebski, 2013). Nevertheless, Hill-Haas, Coutts, Rowsell, & Dawson (2009) found no significant changes in speed based on their investigation following generic and small-sided game training in soccer. Similarly, Radziminski et al, (2013) found no significant changes in 10 m and 30 m sprint. However, aforementioned authors found a slight improvement in the 5-m sprint time in the running group and SSG ($p = 0.04$ and $p = 0.06$, respectively), which is in line with our results. This acceleration was improvement probably due to speed-developing exercises applied to the both groups' players. Moreover, limiting ball touches per possession leads to the increase speed of the game and ball circulation between teammates (Dellal et al., 2011; San Román-Quintana et al., 2013), as well as the speed movement of the opponents which may significantly contribute to the improved reactions in players.

Another finding of this study was the significantly greater improvement in jumping performances after HIT training compared with SSG. Los Arcos et al., (2015) found no significant group differences in CMJ, and only possibly small practical impairment was found for SSG group compared to interval training in the last weeks of the season. Similar results were found in previous studies performed during pre-season and at the start of the in-season period (Hill-Haas, et al, 2009; Impellizzeri et al, 2006; Reilly & White, 2004; Radziminski et al, 2013). However, on the contrary, Dello Iacono, Beato, & Unnithan, (2019) found significant improvement in jumping performances after SSG training in elite young soccer players. This improvement could be due to the repetitive and more frequent high intensity efforts performed during the SSG in mentioned study. This inconsistency of results comes from the fact that different variables could influence the intensity of SSG. Coaches of adolescent players in soccer should change the rules and formats of SSGs not only according to the objectives of the training and the period of the season but also according to the level of team (Hill-Haas, Dawson, Impellizzeri, & Coutts, 2011). This was confirmed by Sarmiento et al, (2018) in recent systematic review stating that different study designs provide a broader knowledge about the possible manipulations of the variables, which leads to the lack of consistency between studies, thus making it difficult to use the results from specific groups of players.

Conclusions

There were some limitations. First, the absence of a control group participating only in the regular training sessions and playing the official matches without any of the experimental protocols, delimits conclusions from this study. There was no power analysis to determine the sample size. However, this is due to the population from which professional soccer players can be drawn, team with a common training background and usual habits. Finally, future studies should also measure more soccer-specific tests, technical skill tests but also reactive agility tests.

In conclusion, during the last weeks of the season, HIT training in addition to the technical and tactical training, improved or maintained fitness status in adolescent soccer players. On contrary, compared to HIT training, SSG training seems to maintain or even decrease the physical performance in the end of the season among adolescent soccer players.

References

- Buchheit, M. (2008). The 30-15 intermittent fitness test: accuracy for individualizing interval training of young intermittent sport players. *The Journal of Strength & Conditioning Research*, 22(2), 365-374.
- Buchheit, M., Mendez-Villanueva, A., Simpson, B. M., & Bourdon, P. C. (2010). Match running performance and fitness in youth soccer. *International journal of sports medicine*, 31(11), 818-825.
- Cohen, J. (2013). *Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences*. Routledge.
- Dellal, A., Chamari, K., Pintus, A., Girard, O., Cotte, T., & Keller, D. (2008). Heart rate responses during small-sided games and short intermittent running training in elite soccer players: a comparative study. *The Journal of Strength & Conditioning Research*, 22(5), 1449-1457.
- Dellal, A., Owen, A., Wong, D. P., Krustup, P., van Exsel, M., & Mallo, J. (2012). Technical and physical demands of small vs. large sided games in relation to playing position in elite soccer. *Human movement science*, 31(4), 957-969.
- Dellal, A., Keller, D., Carling, C., Chaouachi, A., Wong, D. P., & Chamari, K. (2010). Physiologic effects of directional changes in intermittent exercise in soccer players. *The Journal of Strength & Conditioning Research*, 24(12), 3219-3226.
- Dellal, A., Lago-Penas, C., Wong, D. P., & Chamari, K. (2011). Effect of the number of ball contacts within bouts of 4 vs. 4 small-sided soccer games. *International journal of sports physiology and performance*, 6(3), 322-333.
- Dello Iacono, A., Beato, M., & Unnithan, V. (2019). Comparative Effects of Game Profile-Based Training and Small-Sided Games on Physical Performance of Elite Young Soccer Players. *Journal of Strength and Conditioning Research*, 1. doi:10.1519/jsc.0000000000003225
- Hill-Haas, S. V., Coutts, A. J., Rowsell, G. J., & Dawson, B. T. (2009). Generic versus small-sided game training in soccer. *International journal of sports medicine*, 30(09), 636-642.
- Hill-Haas, S. V., Coutts, A. J., Dawson, B. T., & Rowsell, G. J. (2010). Time-motion characteristics and physiological responses of small-sided games in elite youth players: the influence of player number and rule changes. *The journal of strength & conditioning research*, 24(8), 2149-2156.
- Hill-Haas, S. V., Dawson, B., Impellizzeri, F. M., & Coutts, A. J. (2011). Physiology of small-sided games training in football. *Sports medicine*, 41(3), 199-220.
- Sarmento, H., Clemente, F. M., Harper, L. D., Costa, I. T. D., Owen, A., & Figueiredo, A. J. (2018). Small sided games in soccer—a systematic review. *International Journal of Performance Analysis in Sport*, 18(5), 693-749.
- laia, F. M., Ermanno, R., & Bangsbo, J. (2009). High-intensity training in football. *International journal of sports physiology and performance*, 4(3), 291-306.
- Impellizzeri, F. M., Marcora, S. M., Castagna, C., Reilly, T., Sassi, A., laia, F. M., & Rampinini, E. (2006). Physiological and performance effects of generic versus specific aerobic training in soccer players. *International journal of sports medicine*, 27(06), 483-492.
- Jeffreys, I. (2004). The use of small-sided games in the metabolic training of high school soccer players. *Strength & Conditioning Journal*, 26(5), 77-78.
- Jones, S., & Drust, B. (2007). Physiological and technical demands of 4 v 4 and 8 v 8 games in elite youth soccer players. *Kinesiology: International journal of fundamental and applied kinesiology*, 39(2.), 150-156.
- Los Arcos A, Vázquez JS, Martín J, Lerga J, Sánchez F, Villagra F, et al. (2015) Effects of Small Sided Games vs. Interval Training in Aerobic Fitness and Physical Enjoyment in Young Elite Soccer Players. *PLoS ONE* 10(9): e0137224. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0137224
- Mallo, J and Navarro, E. (2008). Physical load imposed on soccer players during small-sided training games. *The Journal of sports medicine and physical fitness*, 48(2), 166–171.

- Howard, N., & Stavrianeas, S. (2017). In-season high-intensity interval training improves conditioning in high school soccer players. *International journal of exercise science*, 10(5), 713-720.
- Orendurff, M. S., Walker, J. D., Jovanovic, M., Tulchin, K. L., Levy, M., & Hoffmann, D. K. (2010). Intensity and duration of intermittent exercise and recovery during a soccer match. *The Journal of Strength & Conditioning Research*, 24(10), 2683-2692.
- Radziminski, L., Rompa, P., Barnat, W., Dargiewicz, R., & Jastrzebski, Z. (2013). A comparison of the physiological and technical effects of high-intensity running and small-sided games in young soccer players. *International Journal of Sports Science & Coaching*, 8(3), 455-466.
- Rampinini, E., Impellizzeri, F. M., Castagna, C., Abt, G., Chamari, K., Sassi, A., & Marcora, S. M. (2007). Factors influencing physiological responses to small-sided soccer games. *Journal of sports sciences*, 25(6), 659-666.
- Reilly, T., & White, C. (2005). Small-sided games as an alternative to interval-training for soccer players. *Science and football V*, 355-358.
- Rowan, A. E., Kueffner, T. E., & Stavrianeas, S. (2012). Short Duration High-Intensity Interval Training Improves Aerobic Conditioning of Female College Soccer Players. *International Journal of Exercise Science*, 5(3), 6.
- San Román-Quintana, J., Casamichana, D., Castellano, J., Calleja-González, J., Jukić, I., & Ostojić, S. (2013). The influence of ball-touches number on physical and physiological demands of large-sided games. *Kinesiology*, 45(2), 171-178
- Sperlich, B., De Marées, M., Koehler, K., Linville, J., Holmberg, H. C., & Mester, J. (2011). Effects of 5 weeks of high-intensity interval training vs. volume training in 14-year-old soccer players. *The Journal of Strength & Conditioning Research*, 25(5), 1271-1278.
- Tessitore, A., Meeusen, R., Piacentini, M. F., Demarie, S., & Capranica, L. (2006). Physiological and technical aspects of "6-a-side" soccer drills. *Journal of sports medicine and physical fitness*, 46(1), 36-43.
- Wong, P. L., Chaouachi, A., Chamari, K., Dellal, A., & Wisloff, U. (2010). Effect of preseason concurrent muscular strength and high-intensity interval training in professional soccer players. *The Journal of Strength & Conditioning Research*, 24(3), 653-660.

Corresponding Author:

Nenad Stojiljković, PhD
 Faculty of sport and physical education
 University of Niš, Serbia
 Čarnojevića 10a, 18000 Niš
 email: snesadif@yahoo.com

Submitted: 10th of November 2019

Accepted: 06th of December 2019