INDIAN RESERVATION POLICIES: REALITY AND CONTRADICTIONS

Deepak P. Gaikwad, Ph.D.

Post Doctoral Fellow of ICSSR New Delhi, at Indian Institute of Education, Pune

Abstract

This research Paper as an interdisciplinary project on “Reservation in Services and Education” with regards to education and status of employment of Dalits Though the emphasis is on Social Reservation, this study inquires into the demands of social reservation of Dalits. Critics have claimed that though sixty years have passed with the implementation of social reservation, expected results with regards changes in social, political and economical life of Dalits have been not accrued in India. It is the same case with Maharashtra.

“Primary Education of masses should be made compulsory up to a certain age say least 12 years”.  
-Jyotiba Phule,

“The scheduled castes have been backward socially, economically and educationally. For quite a long time they have been subjected to various forms of social and economical exploitation. The Constitution of India, therefore, extended protection and safeguards for the scheduled caste either specially or by way of general rights of citizen for maintaining and promoting their educational and economic interest and removing certain social disabilities”  
-R.C Sharma
This research Paper as an interdisciplinary project on “Reservation in Services and Education” with regards to education and status of employment of Dalits Though the emphasis is on Social Reservation, this study inquires into the demands of social reservation of Dalits. Critics have claimed that though sixty years have passed with the implementation of social reservation, expected results with regards changes in social, political and economical life of Dalits have been not accrued in India. It is the same case with Maharashtra.

We are dealing here with the need of the study of reservation in India. This research projects deals with reservation and the making of Indian citizenship: Ambedkar’s critique of Gandhi in his What the Congress and Gandhi have done for the Untouchables. This part analyzes the problematic of reservation with Ambedkar’s program of the annihilation of caste. The idea of “problematic” is taken from Louis Athusser’s Reading Capital. We have done a detailed note on terminology. On a broader social canvas the terms “Dalit” is most appropriate to articulate our thesis on social reservation, since the term “Dalit” involves some sort of democratic radicalism. This broader social canvas is based on the political anthropology of B.R Ambedkar. Ambedkar’s thesis of the annihilation of caste will be central to this work. The study will also explore whether the idea of social reservation is suited for Ambedkar’s original vision.

Social reservation is intrinsically related to reservation in school admission and reservations in services for depress classes in Indian society. This research project also focuses on the views of mass educators like B. R. Ambedkar, Jyotiba Phule, Rajershi Shahoo Maharaja and J. P. Naik, on education and social reservation. This paper consequently explores the functioning of recruitments of teachers and professors in the Indian education system.

Historical Legacy of Reservation in India.

Pre- Independence: (Colonialism followed by the Phule-Ambedkar Era). This part deals with the documentation of the question of reservation, especially after Herbert Risley carried out the Census in India (in 1872) where caste took its “rationalized” form in the form of governmental documentation. Here we deal with the part the Census played in the regimentation of people and the way the Census played in this classification and regimentation. The Weberian idea of “instrumental reason” which the Frankfurt School used
as central part in their sociological research of late capitalist societies is used here in colonial administration of the Indian subcontinent. I have also analyzed whether Ambedkar falls under this genre of instrumental reason or whether he proceeds into a post-instrumental politics. We want to understand the correlation between political reservation and social reservation. In this respect a brief history of political reservation needs being pointed out. It was the Poona Pact that Ambedkar was forced to sign under the duress of Gandhi in the aftermath of the three round table conferences in 1931-2 from whence the idea of Political Reservation emerged. This was Gandhi’s way of negating Ambedkar’s proposal for separate electorates for Dalits. According to Gandhi, Ambedkar’s proposal would dilute the unity of Hindu society and undermine the anti-colonial movement. Gandhi’s fast in 1932 in the Yerwada jail, Pune that caused national tension, forced Ambedkar in giving in to Gandhi’s demands. One can claim that this was some sort of social contract that emerged with the dominance of the Congress elites in the struggle for Indian independence.

2.2 Post-Independence (the Nehruvean Welfare Era). This part deals with the process of the formation of the welfare state under Nehru’s leadership and the place of the subaltern castes within this state-formation.

2.3 After 1992 (the Neo-liberal Era). In this section we have dealt with two opposing dimensions—the first is the rise of the lower castes in politics especially in North India—the rise of the BSP in UP—and the part played by neo-liberal capital accumulation. Whilst the reservation policy has been hotly debated, except the neo-liberal economists who are not very favourable to this entire system of reservation, there has been no rigorously defined alternative to this system yet formulated. And because the legacy of reservation lie in colonial India it is also thought that a colonial basis could exist for this policy. Whilst after the introduction of the Indian Constitution, Dalits and other marginalized groups have got reservation in legislature and public sector, yet results are not fully satisfying. In this Research, I have analyzed whether social reservation really empowers the Dalits. Besides the question of Social reservation and Dalit empowerment, there is another main question that this thesis probes. The question: “how can Dalit unity be possible as the realization of the politics of the Dalit-buhajan community?” “Can this unity be also understood as the unity of the “popular classes”? Can this unified Dalit be then be understood as the “popular class” of Antonio Gramsci?”
In colonial India many social reformers, mass educators has tried to development of weaker section\(^8\) of society through the education. Like Jyotiba Phule, Rajershi Shahoo maharaj, Babasahed Ambedkar and J.P Naik. Jyotiba Phule has linked to directly social reservation and his work for the reservation. In other way I want say today’s social reservation policy need for Dalit because of Phule and Other Mass Educator because if Dalit not got education then no need of any social reservation. So Dalit education is very important for social reservation.

According to Jyotiba Phule, “primary Education of masses should be made compulsory up to a certain age say least 12 years”. \(^9\) One may refer to the 18 Oct 1882 Memorandum to the Hunter Commission in this regard. Phule has fought against castisim, he devoted his whole life foe mass education. According to Citratai Naik\(^10\) “Mhatma Phule says that the founder of the Earth is one, that’s why the human being can not discrimination each other on the basis of Caste and religion.”\(^11\)

A slight note on this radical history of reservation is necessary. One knows that it was Shahoo Maharaj who started separate hostels in Kolhapur for students from the all communities and the boarding especially for the students from the untouchable communities. One also knows that he offered scholarships to the needy and intelligent students from the backward castes so that they could continue their education. He made primary education compulsory and free for all in his Princely State. His royal decree held up the cause of women's education. To abolish untouchability, He introduced reservation for the untouchables in government jobs.

Babasaeb Ambedkar and Reservation Policy as two side of coin which cannot divide each other. The reservation policy has impact of most famous pact, known as Puna Pact between M. K Gandhi and B. R Ambedkar. He played very important role in making of Indian Constitution. He mainly worked for women and Dalit freedom. He fought against untouchabliaty in whole life. He knows that Dalit has a weaker section of Society that’s why he given some reservation to develop them. Ambedkar says in his book *Annihilation of Caste* that whilst caste is a form of “enclosed class’ governed by the laws of graded inequality and division of laborers, his very modernist outlook also made him say that caste was also bound to the oppression of women.

That’s why he focuses on freedom of women.
Social Reservation Policy, Education Policy and annihilation of Caste system have very important correlation. The view of B R Ambedkar for Social Reservation is if Dalit and women get Education easily then get Government services easily and develop social and economical status and do the intercaste marriage. That’s why reduce the Caste System automatically. “The real remedy for breaking Caste is Inter-marriage nothing else will serve as the solvent of caste”\textsuperscript{12}

J. P Naik has not directly linked to Reservation Policy but he linked to education policy. He is famous mass educator in Pune or in India. He is founder of Indian Institute of Education, Pune. He has worked as member secretary of Education commission of India in 1964 to 1966 and educational advisor Government of India.

When I saw the Educational thought of J. P. Naik then I am attract two thought. One is Universal Education and second is common school, because if both thought implemented effectively then it’s helpful to get the aim of social reservation. (Social, economical development of Dalit and annihilation of Caste)

When the people of all Caste and category has get education in one common school then definitely caste system going to an end.

If we study all above view of mass educator and social reformers then we understand the need and importance of social reservation. But the point is to understand today’s reservation system.

\textbf{Type of reservation:}

Reservations are two types, one is Political reservation and another is Social Reservation. A brief history of political reservation needs being pointed out. It was the Poona Pact that Ambedkar was forced to sign under the duress of Gandhi in the aftermath of the three round table conferences in 1931-2 from whence the idea of Political Reservation emerged. This was Gandhi’s way of negating Ambedkar’s proposal for separate electorates for Dalits. According to Gandhi, Ambedkar’s proposal would dilute the unity of Hindu society and undermine the anti-colonial movement. Gandhi’s fast in 1932 in the Yerwada jail, Pune that caused national tension, forced Ambedkar in giving in to Gandhi’s demands. One can claim that this was some sort of social contract that emerged with the dominance of the Congress elites in the struggle for Indian independence.
In this sense one must differentiate the political ideology of Ambedkar and his philosophy of social emancipation and what emerges in the contemporary politics of reservation. One view one could classify as the “elitist” view as it appears as in the works of Centre for Policy Research. Panandiker the Founding Director of the Centre for Policy Research for example talks of the politics of backwardness in his book *The Politics of Backwardness* whilst Christophe Jafferlot talks of the “silent revolution” that the reservation policy has heralded, especially after the Mandal Commission.

**Social reservation:**

Another important type of reservation is Social Reservation. This reservation for SCs, STs, OBCs, Women etc, in School Admission and Government Services. The 50% quota for Reserve and other 50% are open for all caste including who get benefit of Reservation on eligibility of Merit.

The Indian Constitution gave the Reserve quota for backward caste in Indian society on basis of Caste because very much discrimination among the Caste in Indian Caste Hierarchy. SCs and STs has throughout from development Society and Policy like Education, They prohibited from right to speech, right to work, right to eat from the Indian Society. They had not freedom for occupy drinking water. That’s why this reservation policy has on the basis of Caste.

**Reservation In Academics Admissions**

There are 50% reserve seats in school, college and university for SCs, STs and OBC, etc. it’s implemented very well because of its eligibility on Merit base. But wherever the eligibility criteria is interview instead of merit of marks and grade there are not implemented social reservation policy as accepted in school admission. They fill reserve quota correctly but they don’t fill open quota of 50% correctly. The interview comity gave highest marks or grade for upper caste as compare to reserve category. Theoretically they fill open quota of 50% on eligibility of merit but the question is this merit is created by interview comity which is doubtful.

**Reservation in Government Services:**

There are 50% reserve posts in every registered School, College, Institutions and University for SCs, STs and OBCs, etc.
The recruitment of Primary School Teacher\textsuperscript{16} is implemented very well both reserve and open quota, because there recruitment on the eligibility of D.ed marks and grade by the district collector.

The recruitment of college teacher and the faculty of various departments in Universities are implemented very doubtfully. These recruitments on eligibility of merit in interview not important of previous academic record. Indirectly these interview systems in services create a way to corruption. The interview comity selected those people who are favorable. But the point is that if forget the recruitments that how the candidate select and understand all recruitment as reserve seats and open seats. Then we know the reserve posts of 50\% are filling by the interview comity. But the point is that other 50\% open for all caste including reserve category are filled correctly. Then we understand not filed correctly because the tradition is that The OPEN means not OPEN to all Caste it is only for non reserve caste. That’s we seen the 50\% OPEN post occupied or appointed by Upper Caste People\textsuperscript{17}

Conclusion

We listen from our friends and relatives. In School Admissions and services interviews asks the question. How much donation are you giving us? Another matter I listen from my friend, he want apply for OPEN post and he is from reserve category, when he going to apply the principle said “This post for open not for reserve caste, you can not apply” this is a reality. So the question is that the social reservation policy gives the 50\% reservation for backward Caste or Upper Caste. Who is really benefiter of this social reservation policy?

\textsuperscript{16} आर्थिक हां देशभारत वादमस्त वनतः चालधेला कियो अणि समाजात्मक विविध गतामूल आर्थिक होत आर्थिक मानवीय अनुसार जसे लेख आपल्यांसोबत मांडत आहे. या लेखात राजकीय आर्थिक, सामाजिक आर्थिक अणि खासी क्षेत्रातल्या आर्थिक पार्या संबंध केले आहे.

भरताधमे सामाजिक आर्थिक कुरुवान खात्या अर्थात स्वतंत्रयुवृक्ष कालखंडापासून जाणी आहे. या कालखंडात राजस्व शाहू महाराज, म. दुने, डॉ.बाबासाहेब आंबेडकर यांचा सामावेश होतो. १८५२ व्या हांटर कमीशन कडे, म. ज्योतिष्य फुले यांची सर्वांगी भोपाल व संगीतप्रेत शिक्षणाची व सर्वांगी नौकरांमध्ये आर्थिक माणी सर्ववृत्त केली. १९०२ मध्ये राजस्व शाहू महाराजांनी दलितांच्या विकसासाठी कोल्हापूर संस्थानमध्ये दलितांच्या नौकरांमध्ये ५० टक्कक आर्थिक दिले व आर्थिकाच्य मूलभूत शेवळी.

१९५३ मध्ये कालेगावान आयोग नेमण्यात आले व माणासमग्रीपाची आकडेवारी कालखंडात आली व त्यानुसार १९५६ मध्ये या आयोगाने आपला आहारात सादर केलेला. यास सी, ST आणि OBC यांच्यासाठी सामाजिक आर्थिक माणी केली मात्र त्यासाठी वटच सादीनी माणी नाकारली गेली.
1979 मध्ये शैक्षणिक आणि सामाजिक मानवस्त्रोपणा मोजण्यासाठी मंडल आयोगाची स्थापना केली तेसा मंडल आयोगाच्या शिक्षकश्रीनुसार OBC नासामाजिक आरक्षण प्राप्त हाते.

1992 व्या नंतर भारतातो खाजगीकरण, उदारकरण, जागतिकीकरण भोगणाचा स्वीकार केला यात राज्याची लोककल्याणकारी भूमिका मागे पडली. नवउद्योगसत्ताची विचारवंत मान्य सामाजिक आरक्षण प्रमुखाने विशेष केला. आयोगाच्या व्यावहार्याची भूमिका हल्ल्यापूर्ण राहिली. 1992 ला मदास राज्य विविध चेंबारक दोराईयशन खट्टाभाव निर्णयांमध्ये मान्यीले की, जातीय निवडावर असलेले आरक्षण गरजेंच्या व योग्य आहे. तर 1993 ला एम. आर. बालाजी विविध महासराज खट्टाभाव सामाजिक आरक्षणाच्या ५० टकक्षें मराठी ठकली. तर 1992 मध्ये इंदिरा सहसाने केस मध्ये फेंडकाशनाच्या नोकर्त्यात मानवस्वर्गसाठी आरक्षण मार्ग केले. 1994 मध्ये तामिळनाडू राज्याच्या बाजारपणाच्या आहे की त्यांच्या ५० टक्के मराठी पाचव्या. महागृह आपूर्व जातीय आरक्षणाच्या मराठी ५० टकक्षें आहे.

आपूर्व प्रवेश दलित संस्थेन, पड, व्यक्ती नोक्षामध्ये अस्थित्वाच्या राहील जाणा भरत्या मेल्या नाहीत किंवा भरत्या जात नाहीत याच्यांत लहानांत दिसला. मात्र कोणतीही ज्ञा जाणा खुल्या असतात ज्ञात सर्वे जातीयाच आरक्षण पणांच्या जातीसमाज मानवाने असतो. ज्ञा एका समान गुणबल्याची आधारे भरत्यां जातीय असा निवड असतो. तरीही खुल्या जात्याची आरक्षण पणांचा जातीयाचा विवाह फेला जात नाही. काही उदाहरणे असे आहेत की, जेकी एकाचे आरक्षण गटीले उळेत खुल्या प्रवासिसाठी (जो सर्व जातीसाठी खुल्या असतो) अर्ज करतो तेव्हा—तेव्हा ती जाणा खुल्या प्रवासिसाठी आहे. (जे आरक्षण नाहीत ते). महागृह आपूर्व जातीयाला जात नाही. जरी अर्ज सरकारला तर निर्देश करणार्यांनी जातीच्या खुल्या प्रवासिसाठी प्रावधान दिले जाते. महागृह आणि सामाजिक आरक्षणाचे खरे उपमोक्ते आरक्षित पदक आहे की प्रण आरक्षित पदक आहेत हा प्रण पडलो.

. खरे समाचारा आणण्यासाठी जातीय आरक्षित उपादान व्यवधा तोडली पाहिजे. जे बायासाहेब आवेदक प्राक्षण जातीसम्बन्धी उपादान मध्ये म्हणतात, आपण हे तोडण्यासाठी सामाजिक, आरक्षित आणि राजकीय समान असली घडंजे त्यासाठी १) शेतजमीनाचे राष्ट्रीयकरण २) इंद्रांगस राष्ट्रीयकरण ३) कौमन स्कूलः— कौमन स्कूल्या माध्यमातुन माध्यमातुन सर्व जातीयांमध्ये लोक एका शिक्षण पेलेतो, एका राहतील, एका रुद्ध करतो, कौमन स्कूल्या काहीक्रम क्षेत्र प्रवाहात. आळांद तेलुंदरच्या म्हणजेच कही, जर जातीयाचा गट करताना असलेले तर कौमन स्कूल सुगुन केले पाहिजे.

मानक आणि बायासाहेब आवेदक म्हणजेच की, लोकशाही तीन प्रकाराचे असते १) राजकीय लोकशाही २) सामाजिक लोकशाही ३) आरक्षित लोकशाही. महागृह आणि तीन प्रकाराची लोकशाही यसमारी होणारी मानवस्त्रोपणा आरक्षण खरे महाल्या पदक आहे.

इम्पुरल बेल्स्टाईन, अंडर गुंडरफायक, सशीर अमीन आणि विचारलंबांची जागतिक व्यवस्था सिद्धांत आणि प्रवासवंत सिद्धांताचे विवेचन कण्याचा प्रयत्न केला आहे. याच एकूण ४ गटकपैकी Center आणि Periphery हे दोन प्रमुख पदक मानवाते आहेत. युरॉप, अमेरिकी यासारखे राष्ट्र Center मध्ये आहेत तर आशियाई राष्ट्र Periphery मध्ये आहेत. Periphery राष्ट्र Center वर अवलंबून आहेत. हे त्यांचा कल्याच मार्ग व मनुष्यविद्या पुरवितात आणि Center त्याप्रकार प्रकरण करून तोप मार्ग अपार अंतिमीतील Periphery ला पुरवितो व या दोन
Periphery of the Center

Deepak P. Gaikwad

Copyright © 2017, Scholarly Research Journal for Interdisciplinary Studies
We are using the terms of “Dalit” & “SCs” interchangeably. It must be recalled that 2006 National Commission for Scheduled Castes talks of dropping the word “dalit” and replacing it with the term “Scheduled Castes”. The political vocabulary and dynamics of both these will also be taken in the consideration.

Though the idea of political reservation emerged with the Poona Pact its resonance is felt even today.

We refer in The Studies in educational reforms in India volume III Edited by P.R. Pancham ukhi (Indian Institute of Education, Pune 1989), chapter 3 Concessions and Incentives to Educational Institutes for S.C. Student at School stage in Rajasthan page no 67.

We are using the terms of “Dalit” & “SCs” interchangeably. It must be recalled that 2006 National Commission for Scheduled Castes talks of dropping the word “dalit” and replacing it with the term “Scheduled Castes”. The political vocabulary and dynamics of both these will also be taken in the consideration.

Though the idea of political reservation emerged with the Poona Pact its resonance is felt even today.

Depress class ( SC, ST, OBC, Minorities, Women, Other)

Dalit and other marginalized groups

I refer in The Studies in educational reforms in India volume III Edited by P.R. Panchamukhi (Indian Institute of Education, Pune 1989), chapter 3 Concessions and Incentives to Educational Institutes for S.C. Student at School stage in Rajasthan page no 67.

Well known thinker in Pune.


Annihilation of Caste In The Essential Writings of B. R. Ambedkar, Edited by Velerian Rudrigues, (New Delhi; Oxford University Press, 2008)

Copyright © 2017, Scholarly Research Journal for Interdisciplinary Studies
Socially and economically backward caste in Indian Caste System.

Marks and Grads of Previous Academic year

Not take benefit of reservation.

I refer as 1st to 4th, 5th to 7th and 8th to 10th Class Teacher in Government School.

Not included reserve category.